



# Massachusetts Legislature.

BEFORE THE COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS AND CANALS

HEARING ON THE

PETITION OF OTIS PETTEE AND OTHERS, AND ON THE  
MEMORIAL OF SAMUEL RUSSELL AND OTHERS,

*March 26th, 1847, in the Senate Chamber.*

CLOSING ARGUMENT BY CHARLES G. LORING, Esq

MR. CHAIRMAN AND GENTLEMEN OF THE COMMITTEE:

I HAVE the honor to stand before you, as the humble representative of about 6,000 inhabitants of this State; of 1,135 of the citizens of Woonsocket, and its vicinity in Rhode Island; and of the memorialists representing a very large portion of the people of the State of Connecticut, seeking to obtain of the Legislature of Massachusetts, through your intervention and approbation, leave for the accomplishment of an enterprise which they believe to be of great importance to themselves, to this Commonwealth, and to the whole country.

They are not here to sue for the bounty of the State in draughts upon her treasury, or gratuitous appropriations of her domain, nor to ask for any sacrifice of public or private property, or vested rights; but simply for permission, at their own cost, and with full indemnity for all who might otherwise suffer loss, to level the hills and exalt the valleys through a small portion of the Commonwealth, scattering, with liberal hand, the rewards of skill and industry, on either side, as they advance, and for the ultimate end of adding, yearly, increasing millions to her wealth, and multiplying indefinitely the resources of industry, enterprise, and intelligence, among her people.

All the petitioners and memorialists, whom I represent, together with all the subscribers to the petition of Thomas H. Perkins and others, are united in the one great object, of a direct and continuous rail-road from Boston through the States of Rhode Island and Connecticut to the city of New York; the memorialists from Connecticut expressing no other preference than for the establishment of that route which shall most speedily and beneficially accomplish the end proposed.

It is respectfully submitted, that no question of like importance has been presented, for legislative action, since the establishment of the Western Rail-road. And, in view of the great number of petitioners, the extent of territory which they represent, and of the different States and cities, and industrial population, interested in the result, it may be doubted whether any project, hitherto here discussed, ever embraced a greater extent of agricultural, manufacturing, and commercial capital and enterprise.

The two greatest commercial cities in the Union, over 200 miles apart, are here, asking to be united by a road that may be traversed in seven hours—less than the third part of a day; four independent States, seeking to be connected in immediate fellowship, that their great resources of wealth, and enterprise, and industry, may be developed and made accessible to each other, and to distant regions: and vast reservoirs of power, hitherto unemployed, awaiting only the facilities of access which this road would afford, to pour a flood of wealth along its course into the Commonwealth.

But, while sustained and encouraged by the vast numbers of petitioners and memorialists whom it is my honor to represent, and the great extent of commercial, manufacturing and agricultural interests which I advocate, I am not unmindful of the formidable, and seemingly almost overwhelming, opposition with which I have to contend. The united energies of the Western, Boston and Worcester, Boston and Providence, and Norwich and Worcester Rail-road Corporations, and of numbers of the wealthy capitalists in this State, and occupants of the palaces of the city, are arrayed against the project before the Committee.

All that professional talent can do, and all that every species of influence can accomplish, is put in requisition for its defeat; and, considering the numbers, the wealth, the social position, and *political*, and last, but by no means least, the *editorial* influence of the officers and stockholders of these great corporations, and of the other opponents, the petitioners may well be alarmed for the result; for the voice of truth and reason is too often subdued and quelled in such a conflict with interest and prejudice.

No weapon has been left untried; no stone unturned, no stratagem unattempted. Argument and invective, logic and sneers, assertion, insinuation, and rampant patriotism, have all been alike brought into service, and marshalled in thick array against the central route.

But, sir, so far as this question is to be decided by truth and reason, this mighty and fearful opposition is a sufficient basis for the greatest confidence on the part of those whom I represent. It tells us, in language that is not to be mistaken, that there is something, in the plan we propose, *so important to the public, and therefore so hostile to their interests*; that this tremendous array is necessary to counteract and defeat it. Men do not marshal armies, and expend treasures, "to fight a shadow"—to use the language of one of the opposing counsel; nor send the ablest generals to contend with spectres; nor would they raise a tempest to drown a fly.

The magnitude of an opposition is a just measure of the apprehension of real danger. The zeal and intensity with which an interest is defended, are the best criterion of the hazard to which it is thought to be exposed.

If the design be so futile and absurd as they contend, why trouble themselves about it? The granting of a charter will not construct the road; and if it be so impracticable or useless a project as they pretend to think it, why not indulge these simple people, whom I represent, with the gratification of their whim, and let them have their charter, find out their own folly, and exhibit themselves to the world as a monument of infatuation? The example might be useful, if one tenth part be true of that which the remonstrants here have asserted.

Sir, I am glad of this public array against us. I am glad of it as the best pledge I can have of the real utility and magnitude of the design I advocate. I am glad of it, because it necessarily brings to public view all the reasons upon which this opposition is founded, which can properly be disclosed, or on which they dare ask to have the question decided; and enables us to weigh them before the eyes of the public and in the scales of common honesty and common sense, instead of having to follow and contend with them in the windings and lurking-places of private and lobby influences. It gives us the benefit of a fair field and open day, and that is all we ask.

The learned counsel of the Western Rail-road,—who is nominally here for that corporation alone, but who has equally advocated the interests of the Boston and Worcester, and Norwich and Worcester roads,—among other sneers at these petitioners, has told you that, if you refuse the charter, they will

go home and *thank you* for *saving* them the loss of further time and money.

Sir, he greatly mistakes the characters and designs of the persons for whom he thus undertakes to speak. Eight thousand petitioners from Massachusetts, and a large number from Rhode Island, and the representatives of a great portion of the people of Connecticut, with a design in their hands for the promotion of the great interests of their several States and themselves, who have thought long and deliberately upon the subject, and are moving in concert under a deep and settled conviction that the measure is one of incalculable benefit to themselves and their country, are not to be thus easily stopped and turned aside. They are not to be so easily convinced, that they need to be put under the guardianship of his clients, nor even under that of the great State of Massachusetts.

This scheme, sir, will be persevered in until it is accomplished. It is too great, too deeply affecting the welfare of the public and themselves, and too obviously important, to be trampled upon and broken down by any temporary opposition, however well organized and imposing, and however supported by a popular influence carefully gotten up and promoted for the purpose. The road through Rhode Island and Connecticut will be created at some future and not long-distant time: no man of impartial judgment can doubt it. The only question is, whether it shall pour its treasures into Massachusetts, or, by our short-sighted selfishness, be turned to roll them into the capital of Rhode Island. That is the question; and, with great respect, I submit that this Committee is now perhaps under the responsibility of its final solution.

As some misapprehension has seemed to exist concerning our object, I repeat the statement made at the opening of our case. We are not here, asking of this Legislature the grant of a charter for a road from Boston to New York: every one knows that this State has no power to grant one. Nor do we ask for the grant of one to the line of the State, *merely and only as a part* of such a continuous road, as has been charged.

But we ask for a road from Boston to Woonsocket; that is the *whole extent* of the road prayed for in our petition; and we further ask for power to unite with other roads to be extended from it through Rhode Island and Connecticut to the city of New York.

1st. We seek the establishment of such a road with the design and expectation of its continuance through Rhode Island and Connecticut to the city of New York—constituting the shortest and speediest route between that city and Boston.

2d. But we also seek it, as being demanded by the public convenience, as a means of rail-road communication between

the Blackstone Valley and Boston, and the intermediate towns, independently of any such continuation.

3d. And as altogether superior in the advantages it will afford over all the others proposed, considered either as the commencement of such a road to New York, or merely as such communication between the valley of the Blackstone and this city, and any other intermediate towns.

Nor do we ask the Legislature to prescribe the terms and conditions upon which this road, if granted, shall constitute a portion of the line through to New York. That must of necessity be matter of future arrangement with the holders of the charters in other States, and may safely be left to them, and of course be dependent upon many considerations not now foreseen. We only ask the permission thus to unite it with any that may be authorized, through those States, upon such terms as justice to the stockholders and the interests of this Commonwealth may require.

For the sake of perspicuity, I shall present the views I have to offer under the following propositions:—

I. That a rail-road from Boston to the line of this State, to be continued thence through Rhode Island and Connecticut to the city of New York, in the manner proposed, is required for the promotion of the public welfare, and would be profitable to the owners.

II. That the road, as prayed for by Otis Pettee and his associates, is the most suitable, if not the only one suitable, for the attainment of an extension through Rhode Island; and is better adapted than any other proposed, for the general purposes of a through road.

III. That, considered as a through road, it would not conflict or interfere with the vested rights, or reasonable claims or expectations, of any other chartered or established road.

IV. That a road from Boston to the line of the State, for the purpose of connection with Woonsocket, on the route prayed for by Otis Pettee and others, considered as a local road only, from Boston to Woonsocket, is required for the public good, and would be profitable to the owners.

V. That this road, considered as *such local road only*, is far preferable to any other proposed, in reference to the combined elements of extent of public accommodation, expense of construction, and freedom from interference or conflict with the vested rights or reasonable claims of other existing or chartered roads.

It is far from my intention to follow the counsel who have preceded me in reply to most of the details of their respective arguments, and much less to the rhetorical flourishes, sneers, and witticisms, that have been so unsparingly resorted to.

There has been one allusion, however, deserving passing notice, for the capital that has been attempted to be made of it by each orator in his turn,—who seems to think it too admirable a hit not to be perpetually repeated:—I refer to the appellation attempted to be affixed to the route I advocate, as the self-styled “air-line.”

Now, it unfortunately happens, for the justice and keenness of this favorite specimen of satire, that the name was never assumed by those who projected and advocate this route, but was first put upon it by their opponents, in derision. It is the stale device of the enemy, seeking to lay his own bantling at his neighbor's door.

I have not come here, sir, to attempt to be witty. If I had the wish, nature has denied the faculty; and observation inclines me to think, that this is cause of gratitude rather than of regret. Nor shall I attempt to be eloquent. I have neither power, time, nor inclination, and have, besides, something much more important to do. I shall not, sir, attempt to make a speech, but an argument. I shall endeavor to *convince* you seven gentlemen composing this committee, as if you were my only auditors; and it will not disappoint nor trouble me, if, at the end of my first half hour, I shall be left alone with you.

I. My first proposition is, that a rail-road from Boston to the line of this State, to be continued thence, through Rhode Island and Connecticut, to the city of New York, in the manner proposed, is required for the promotion of the public welfare, and would be profitable to the owners.

The importance of the proposed road is to be considered in a twofold aspect:—1st. As a means of the most immediate communication between New York and Boston, and, 2d, as connecting, with this State, the extensive manufacturing commercial and agricultural districts of Rhode Island and Connecticut, now almost entirely excluded from any intercourse with it.

1st. As a means of the most immediate communication between New York and Boston.

Of the incalculable importance of the speediest practicable transmission of merchandise, letters, and persons, between these two great commercial cities, no reasonable or practical man can doubt for an instant. It is one of those self-evident propositions that, to men of business, defies all argument. As a general truth, the mere saving of time, in the intercourse between different communities, is so much added to the life of man and the progress of humanity. It is not merely a convenience, a facility, an agreeable acquisition to our means of enjoyment or of activity and usefulness; it is so much added to our capacity for accomplishing the purposes of existence. Every minute thus saved in the daily transportation of 500

persons, contributes an addition of over eight hours, or a day's work of one man, to the working time of the community.

Nor is it merely in the capacity for greater accomplishment in what is already understood and known, that the value of this saving is alone found. It is perhaps even more important, as the means of accelerating our race in physical, social, and intellectual improvement. The impulse given to human energy—the speedy transmission of all the advancements in science and art, and of the impressions of thought and feeling upon topics of common interest—render still further progress the more sure and rapid; so that every discovery, or onward step, becomes the precursor of others still more rapid.

The promotion, therefore, of any important plan for advancing facilities of intercourse and communication between distinct sections of the country, is matter of public interest as part of a great national system, or scheme, worthy at all times of the most serious and favorable consideration of a national or State Legislature.

But that now under consideration, it is believed, is of peculiar interest and magnitude. The two cities which it purposes to connect, stand second to none, in their influence and importance, in relation to each other and to other parts of this country. One, the commercial emporium of the United States; the other, that of New England, rapidly approaching her sister in importance and influence. The commercial relations between them, and those of Boston with the South and West, and the importance of intercommunication between them in reference to their respective *foreign commercial* relations, that the information from abroad may be, in both, as *simultaneous* as possible, imperatively demand that their intercourse should be as *rapid and uninterrupted*, as may be practicable; and *will ere long effect that object*, whether the mode now proposed be adopted or rejected. The commercial world, the energetic business world, in the midst of which we are, *demand* and *will have it*, whether we will it or refuse it now.

It is all-important to the merchants and the manufacturers of these great cities and regions referred to, and to the vast numbers who are interested in the closest of domestic and business relations, to diminish, by every possible fraction, the space that divides them from each other; it is essential to the equal prosperity of these merchants and manufacturers, and through them to every citizen in the State, that the *commercial news*, both public and private, received in New York almost daily by their numerous packet-ships plying to Europe and the South, and the numbers and speed of which are yearly increasing, should be instantly transmitted to this city by mail; and that the quickest possible transportation of persons interested in



commercial operations should follow the news. The magnetic telegraph may transmit the chief public, and a part of the private intelligence; but by far the greatest portion, and nearly all that is most essential in intercourse concerning mercantile operations and affairs, can only be communicated by mails and passenger accommodations.

No city in the world can have greater interest in *direct and immediate communication* with another, than Boston has with New York; and New York has scarcely less for one with Boston. For, since the establishment of the lines of steam-packets between Liverpool and the cities of Boston and New York alternately, *every hour's* delay in the intercommunication of news and passengers is of the most serious importance; nor is it less so in reference to the transmission of letters and passengers from either city to Europe.

The repeated failures of arrival of mails and passengers from the South, in season for the steam-packets from this port to Liverpool, are strikingly illustrative of the insufficiency of the present arrangements, or any other than that now proposed; and warn us that such evils will not long be endured by this or the southern cities.

Last year, a mail of 8000 letters, and about twenty passengers, lost their opportunity by one of these packets, owing to the detention of a steam-boat on the New York line; and, this season, another most material and similar interruption has occurred.

The testimony of the postmaster upon this subject is most emphatic, and decisive of the utter insufficiency of the present arrangements, and of the utter want of regularity and certainty in the arrival of the mails.

The evils of this state of things, in a commercial point of view, can hardly be exaggerated. It is not improbable that the disastrous results, to individuals, of those interruptions, would go far to equal the expenditure for constructing this road.

I might appeal to the Committee, also, in behalf of humanity, to interpose this avenue for the protection of human life, to secure families and communities from the appalling losses and miseries that have ensued from the present mode of transportation. The shrieks from the Lexington, and the moans from the Atlantic, are still vibrating along the waters of the Sound. The loss of most precious lives—the sorrow of the bereaved and desolate—are still causing multitudes of hearts to beat with emotion, and bringing many in sorrow to the grave. They call aloud for legislative interposition to remove, if not the necessity of, at least the inducements to, these dangers, by substituting another mode of conveyance, free from such expo-

sure, which, at the same time, affords greater regularity, rapidity, and precision.

The public mind is clearly made up on this subject. The great number of petitioners who come here to ask for such a route to New York is conclusive of the public need; and scarcely an individual can be met with, not having a strong personal interest in some rival route, who does not unhesitatingly declare his conviction of its vital importance.

Nor is it merely as a mode of transporting passengers that this route is demanded by the public necessities. It would be almost equally so in the transmission of freight between the two cities. Little is now done in comparison with what would doubtless be accomplished, if a regular, direct, and uninterrupted route by land-carriage were substituted.

The Committee have knowledge of the plan, already sanctioned by their report in favor of a charter, for connecting the most important rail-roads with the deepest water in the harbor at East Boston; and have heard the testimony concerning the effects of a direct line communicating with New York, as a means of restoring to this city and State the East India commerce which belongs to it, but which has, of late years, centered at New York; and there can be no reasonable question that such a line of connection, between Boston and New York, as now exists between Boston and Albany, would have a vast effect in facilitating the commercial intercourse between the cities by such a rapid, direct, and certain conveyance, substituted for the circuitous and hazardous transmission by sea, or the combined boat and rail-road navigation. Such a road would soon become the chief means of transmitting all those articles of merchandise of which the value is greatly disproportionate to the bulk.

I am informed, by most intelligent merchants, that, upon teas, and all articles made of cotton, flax, woollen, or silk, and others where the bulk is so disproportionate to the value, the mere insurance upon them by water would pay the freight upon such a road at the rates for which it could be transported, if the trade should take this direction, as they believe it certainly would in the most valuable articles of merchandise, and those requiring the most regular and *speedy* transmission; and equal confidence is felt that it would soon become the regular channel for transmission of our manufactures, and of all the merchandise between the two cities, the quick and punctual arrival of which is of much importance.

It is no longer matter of speculation and hypothesis as to the results of such a road. That between Albany and Boston speaks, in language not to be mistaken or misunderstood, of the rapid and almost incredible reduction of rates of transporta-

tion as business accumulates ; the charge for transporting many articles from one city to another, above 170 miles, having been at times hardly more than the cost of trucking it to the house or store after its arrival. Wise men believe, and think they know that a similar road between these two great cities would produce similar results, and add almost as much to the commercial business and wealth of the State.

But it would be needless to press this point further.—The necessity of a direct land route, by rail-road, to New York, is too obvious to need proof, or to be any longer successfully resisted.

And this is now most emphatically manifested by the course taken by the Western Rail-road. Last year, this Western Road appeared as remonstrants against this project, and deemed it chimerical and futile, and asserted that the existing lines by the Providence and Stonington roads, and the Worcester, Norwich, and Long Island road, and the Western and Springfield and Hartford roads to New Haven, and *steam-bouts for each* of these routes, afforded *all the necessary accommodation*, and that this, therefore, was not needed, and could not compete with those then existing.

But now the tune is changed : and the great reason why these petitioners are to be sent bootless hence is, not because this road is not wanted, but because the Western Road is expected to be united with that from New Haven to New York, and so make a continuous land route and itself supply the previously existing defect.

This move has been made since the last year : and some of the managers of the Western Road have taken the stock, and a large portion of the whole is taken in this city.

This is certainly very strongly symptomatic of a belief that a through road by land was demanded by the public, and would be had ;—and the movement, if originating, as is supposed, with the friends of the Western and Worcester Roads, was a very safe and judicious one ;—for, if the New Haven and New York Road would be profitable if connected with the Western Road, it will of course be more so if either of these proposed through routes be established ; for all the transportation from either must go over that portion between New Haven and New York.

The taking up of that stock, therefore, and the commencement of that road, while it is full proof of the necessity of a land route, is no proof that either of those petitioned for here is not altogether the best suited for the purposes of such a route. But this question seems put at rest by the testimony of Mr. Gilmore and Mr. Dwight, directors of the Western Road, who expressly testify that a continuous land route is demanded by the public, and is essential for its wants.

But, so far as this question of communication between New York and Boston is alone involved, it has been argued, that this exigency will be answered by the Western Road in connexion with the New Haven and New York Road; and that none, therefore, exists for another.

And this brings us to the question, whether that road will answer the purpose as well, or so nearly as well, as the routes proposed, as to supersede the necessity of either of them.—And we submit that it most clearly cannot.

The Committee will recollect, that the only point of comparison, now, is of their relative merits as means of communication between these two cities. The other objects, or advantages, are for distinct consideration.

We have already shown, that the most urgent necessity exists for the quickest and most regular communication possible between these two cities; and that the industrial interests of the whole State are deeply interested in effecting it:—that there are no two points in the Union between which a rapid and punctual transmission of mails and passengers can at all compare in importance, so far as this Commonwealth is concerned; and that the transmission of freight upon a direct and regular road would be of hardly less moment.

And, in view of these great purposes, we submit, with great confidence, that the junction of the Western Rail-road with that of Springfield and Hartford, and that of Hartford to New Haven, and that of New Haven to New York, can never compare, for speed, regularity and precision, with a direct line from Boston to New York,—*that being the main end and purpose of its establishment and management.*

In the first place, this cannot be because, while a direct through route would be an independent road throughout, mainly devoted to the business of intercommunication between these two great termini, and the places along its line, the proposed road from New York to New Haven, and thence to the Western Road at Springfield, is a *branch road merely*, and must ever *continue* so to be; and the business upon it, therefore, must always be *subordinate*, and *adapted* to the main business for which it was designed, and which must demand and require its first care and chief attention.

The Western Road was avowedly and exclusively established to connect Western New York, and the Lake countries beyond, with Massachusetts. It is most gloriously accomplishing its end, and already *crowded to repletion* with that business, constantly increasing. It has more than it can now do; and the demands upon it will be yearly and daily increasing, from the vast extent of rich country with which it is connected, and the industrial population multiplying upon it, beyond all precedent. The

business upon that road has already doubled within four years, and will soon overcome its capacities. All its resources, therefore, and all its energies, should be devoted to that purpose, and cannot prove more than sufficient for it.

A branch, therefore, running into it *from New York*, must be a *subordinate* and very inferior concern, and is expected to be so, as appears by the testimony of Mr. Gilmore and Mr. Dwight, who testify to the uncertain, or small amount anticipated; and whenever their interests conflict, that must yield. And the great delays of changing cars that must always take place once at least, and the frequent stoppages and waitings that the accommodation of so many conflicting and competing trains will, from time to time, occasion, must cause great irregularity and detention.

Besides, it is to be remembered that the Western Road is essentially a *freight road*; that must ever be its principal business; and that this business, from the comparative slowness of its trains, must always cause greater embarrassment than passenger trains.

The fact, therefore, that the New Haven and Springfield route must be part of a *branch road to the Western*, already crowded with business, and daily becoming more so, is of itself a sufficient reason why it can never be traversed with the speed, regularity and precision of an independent through direct line.

But this is not all: it is but the least of this evil. The Western Road, to which it is proposed to connect that from New Haven as a branch, is but itself a branch of the Worcester Road, having a very great, independent, and disconnected business of its own; thus complicating and involving the business of two great establishments, and, of course, rendering necessary more or less of delay in their operations.

Nor is this all:—The Worcester Road has already three other branches, coming from different regions of country, bringing totally distinct and disconnected business, and thus accumulating upon it a heterogeneous and complex mass of arrangements and efforts, quite sufficient, one would think, for any reasonable degree of rapidity, safety, or precision, in its movements. Thus, the Norwich and Worcester pours in freight and passengers from Connecticut and New York; the Worcester and Nashua from New Hampshire; and the Worcester and Providence will soon do so from Rhode Island and the Blackstone Valley; to say nothing of four collateral spurs. And all these sources will doubtless continue to produce annually *increasing business for this road*, as the annual returns show.

Thus, then, we have the Worcester road, as one main trunk, —already possessing one branch extending to the Western and Lake country, and the western part of Massachusetts; one to New Hampshire; one to Rhode Island; one to Connecticut; and at least four other branches in this State,—crowded with business already to repletion, annually increasing to an almost indefinite extent, and with accelerating rapidity. And now it is *proposed to add to it another branch, connecting it with New York, as a means of accomplishing the passage between that city and Boston for passengers and freight in the most speedy and punctual manner practicable.* The proposition bears absurdity upon its face.

It is obvious, that a branch road can never answer the purposes of a through route to New York; or that, if any could, *this* cannot.

The testimony of Mr. Carruth is conclusive to this effect. 'The Old Colony, with its little business, has already been compelled to leave for want of sufficient accommodation; and the constant annual increase will soon render it impossible to transmit all the business flowing into its depots from its existing branches.'

Another fatal objection to the proposed route by the Western Rail-road, is the additional distance. It is at least twenty-four miles farther. This, supposing the roads otherwise equal, makes a difference of nearly an hour in time. But it has been attempted to show, that this difference in distance will be in great measure compensated for, in time, by the advantage of double tracks on the Western Road; and that it is in contemplation to lay them soon from Worcester to Springfield, if allowed to retain the New York travel.

If they intend waiting for the profits of this travel as now shown, the tracks will not be laid these many years, unless those profits are much misrepresented. But, if that be done, it will give a double track for less than half the way to New York, and that from Springfield to New York will still be single only, and will probably so remain for years to come, at least.

But what can be more futile and deeeptive than such arguments? Is it not competent for the direct road to have double tracks as well as the Western, and is there not full as good reason to believe that, if this road be established, double tracks will very soon be laid? It will be that, of all others, where double traeks will be most wanted; and, if the profits be as anticipated, they can very soon be afforded. So that the utmost that can be urged in this behalf is, that the Western Road may have double tracks for less than half the way, a little earlier than one of these roads would have them to a still greater distance.

But it is contended, that the grades and curvatures on the

Western and Springfield Road are more favorable than those through Connecticut on the proposed route, and that this will tend to counterbalance, in some measure, the difference in distance; though it is conceded that, upon the comparisons thus made, there may be a saving of 15 to 30 minutes on our line notwithstanding.

It is to be remembered, however, that these computations are made by gentlemen who are superintendents of the existing roads competing for this travel; and, however candid and ingenious,—and I believe them to be as much so as any men can be in like circumstances,—they are necessarily exposed to every possible bias against this line and in favor of the Western Road.

In the second place, it is most material to bear in mind, that they estimated the gradients upon the proposed road as being from 50 to 60 feet per mile with short and sharp curvatures; whereas, the testimony of Mr. Johnson and Mr. McDonough is, that the grades may all easily be reduced to 50 feet, and probably would be upon a locating survey. The computations of the remonstrants' witnesses are made upon the actually existing grades and curves of the Western Road, which are the most favorable that could be selected, and upon a merely preliminary survey of ours, which, the engineers say, could be greatly improved by actual location.

Another disadvantage under which this comparison is made is, that we have not, and cannot obtain, the radii of the curves on the Western and Springfield, and Hartford and New Haven Roads, though called for; nor can we procure their sum of ascent and fall. We have not, therefore, the proper means of accurate, or hardly of approximate comparison; and in the manner in which it is made, there is a clear error in assuming the grades to be 5 and 10 feet higher than they need be. It is very manifest that, considering the grades and curvatures between Boston and Rhode Island, and Boston and Worcester, they are very much in favor of the proposed road; and that the maximum grades are much higher on the Western Road than on any part of the direct route. The proof is, that this road may be travelled in 7 hours.

The admission of Mr. Parker and Mr. Lee, that there might be a saving of from 15 to 30 minutes, is most material, coming from that quarter, and the extreme may be safely relied upon. But their estimates were solely upon the difference of distance, and curvatures, and grades, and under the errors and disadvantages pointed out, without reference to the delays and embarrassments, before suggested, arising from its being one among many branches of roads already crowded, and which soon must be overburdened if the business upon them shall continue

to increase at the present ratio of augmentation : there can be no doubt, as the engineers testify, but that, upon a final location, easier grades may be obtained, and many curvatures lessened or avoided ; and, should the road be established and go into operation, and prove as profitable and important to the public as is confidently anticipated, its capacity for speed will doubtless be constantly increasing. That will soon become a paramount object in reference to mails and passengers ; and with all the improvements that are so rapidly taking place in *roads*, and *engines*, and arrangements, it is reasonable to believe that the distance may, ere long, be traversed in five or six hours by the mail trains, and regularly in seven by the accommodation lines.

But another essential, and perhaps still more important, difference between these roads, has been kept entirely out of sight ; and that is, the *great increase of expense* in consequence of this difference of distance. The charges are necessarily computed by the mile for the expenses of keeping the road in order, and wear and tear of engines and cars, and of attendance ; and all those included in the term "running expenses" are necessarily in the ratio of distance.

Now, this difference amounts to about 13 per cent. upon transportation of both passengers and freight, or \$13 000 upon every \$100 000 ; and this saving, by the direct route, of itself constitutes an exigency or reason for its establishment. Upon any great business between the two cities, it would pay the income on a very large portion of its cost.

It is evident, therefore, that the great exigency of a direct land route through to New York will not be sufficiently met and answered by the proposed union of the Western Road with the branch to New Haven and New York ;—that such a line cannot afford the facilities for transportation with the despatch, and punctuality, and *cheapness*, that the public wants demand, and which the proposed route would furnish.

Much has been said about the preference of men of business for night trains, and of the certainty that they will be resorted to by men of business ; but there is every reason to believe, that the direct route would furnish the best means of reaching New York in that manner. Those electing that course, may leave Boston in the afternoon at four, reach New Haven in four hours, and take the boat from New Haven, thus avoiding all the dangerous navigation of the Sound, and the inconvenience of a late arrival, if that be worth avoiding ; while those who prefer the land route may continue on their journey to New York, and arrive there in season to obtain from six to seven hours of good quiet sleep ; while the morning train, leaving this city at seven, will reach New York to dine. As an accommodation for those



travelling for pleasure or business, it will be, beyond comparison, the most convenient and agreeable arrangement compared with any other now existing or in contemplation.

We have, thus far, considered the importance of the proposed road, as a means of immediate communication between Boston and New York only, and trust that we have satisfied the Committee of the exigency for one, and that it is not answered by any other now existing or projected. We have, next, to invite attention to this road, considered as connecting this city and Commonwealth with the extensive, and wealthy, and rapidly growing manufacturing regions of Connecticut and Rhode Island, through which it would pass, and from which all intercourse is now comparatively precluded; and we submit, with entire confidence, that, considered as a local road merely, extending only from this city to New Haven, it is a most desirable and important end to be attained: that, throwing aside the business between New York and Boston altogether, the local business along its line, between New Haven and Boston, will be highly profitable to the proprietors of the road; and that its construction will conduce greatly to the wealth and prosperity of this city and Commonwealth.

Happily, we are not obliged to appear before the Committee, as last year, with merely general information concerning the character of the country, and its population and resources. We were then told that it was a *terra incognita*; that our whole or main reliance must be upon the through travel, and that no material aid could be anticipated from local business. But we are now enabled to present to the Committee well authenticated statistics, leaving, as is believed, no room for reasonable doubt of the capability of this road for self-maintenance through this State, Rhode Island and Connecticut; and that its construction will bring us into immediate connexion with an immense extent of water-power and manufacturing capital and population of the greatest importance;—and by means of which our own wealth and enterprise will be greatly increased and promoted.

It appears, by the map, that the proposed road will pass through *portions of six out of the eight counties composing the State of Connecticut*. It is proved, by the testimony of the gentlemen from Connecticut, and the statistics furnished by them, that the population, in towns within five miles of the line, on either side, amounts to ninety-one thousand four hundred persons; that the number of cotton and woollen mills, already established in towns lying within five miles of the line, is *ninety-nine*, and of saw and grist-mills, is one hundred and eighty-seven; that the capital already invested in manufacturing business along the line, is \$4,772,787, and the annual returns from it are \$8,510,635; that the employed water-power on the

line, and within seven miles of it, at Willimantic, is equal to sixty-four thousand spindles, and the unemployed to one hundred and thirty thousand—equal to one hundred ninety-four thousand, of which more than three fourths are within three fourths of a mile of the line; while at East Haddam and Colchester, also on the line, is power for fifty-five thousand more,—making a total of power equal to two hundred and forty-nine thousand spindles, exceeding that reputed to be at Lowell. And it further appears, from the tables of statistics, supported by testimony of the purest and most unsuspecting character, that the transportation of freight and passengers along the road through Connecticut, without allowing a farthing for any coming upon it beyond the Eastern line or the city of New Haven,—*and without computing agricultural products, live stock, or lumber*,—would afford an adequate means of maintaining the road, and giving a large interest on the outlay.

Indeed, no one can cast his eye upon the map, or the table of statistics, and see the country through which the road passes, the great number of manufacturing establishments already existing, and the extent of population, without perceiving that these estimates are made altogether within bounds: too low, indeed, for a fair computation of the resources of a rail-road in that region. If the persons who prepared these tables had possessed the skill and knowledge, not to say the imagination, which distinguish the exhibits usually made on these occasions, they would have been able to present a plausible statement of an income of from 25 to 50 per cent. upon the stock, after paying running expenses. They have entirely left out all the transportation of animals, wood, lumber, hay, grain, stock and stone, and other materials, which figure so largely in most statistical accounts, and are very justly entitled to great consideration. The freestone quarries on the Connecticut River, within a stone's throw of the road, are entirely omitted. But who can doubt that this road would soon become the means of conveyance of it, wrought and fitted for use? No one, I think, can read the memorial and table of statistics, and testimony in support of them, without being satisfied that very few, if any, roads were ever presented to the Legislature, promising a greater amount of income from local business between this city and the region through which it was projected. But when *we add to this the business that would immediately spring up between these places, and between them and Boston*, upon their connexion by a rail-road, it is hazarding little to say that no road ever projected afforded more rational expectation of abundant usefulness and profit to its owners and the public.

And how is this testimony, with regard to the statistics of Connecticut, to be encountered? I had expected that some effort

would have been made to counteract it by testimony showing, either that the representations were exaggerated, or the computations fallacious; or that some witnesses, at least, would be introduced to express opinions that these tables and testimony do not afford satisfactory proof of a profitable road; and we stood fully prepared to meet such testimony, if offered, by further evidence, and the opinions of practical and experienced men well versed in rail-road statistics; but none such have been offered. A dead silence has hitherto reigned upon this subject. The counsel for the Western and Walpole rail-roads have avoided the subject, or dealt with it only in round assertion.

Has the disclosure of the views of our opponents upon this most important part of the case been left for the counsel of the Milford route, to whom has been awarded the great privilege of closing this debate; and who, having only nine miles of road, and one town, to advocate the interests of, may devote nearly all his time to opposing the great roads prayed for? And has it been thought prudent and advisable to keep back the points of opposition, and mode of attack, until after we had left the field? Whether this was by design or not, such is the state of the case. Not an intimation has been given how, or in what manner, this attempt is to be made.

In this state of the case, I am left to anticipation merely; but a little experience enables us to foresee the course to be taken. I suppose, sir, that one mode will be, to take the Connecticut tables of amounts of freight and passengers, and rates charged for transportation, and show that the rates are too high, and that, reduced to a level with those upon the established rail-roads, they would not yield the supposed profit, if any. It will be said, that we have charged seven cents per mile for freight where other roads charge three; and three cents for passengers, where they charge from two to three.

Well; if this be so, I submit that it would be unreasonable and absurd to put down our rates to a level with those of old and established roads. Most of these are *competing roads*, where the charges are necessarily low both for passengers and freight; and where the gradual increase of custom has authorized corresponding deductions in the rates of fare. The proposed road will pass through a country entirely unaccommodated, and where they can well afford to pay these, and even greater prices, for this accommodation, and yet save vastly from the expenses of their present modes of transportation. The price for passengers is not above the average, on most roads, for way travel, until very recently; and it is well known that way freight pays much more than through freight. This road will pay the usual rate of freight and passage for new roads, until the transportation shall become so great as to authorize and require a re-

duction of prices corresponding with that of roads long established.

But I submit to the Committee, that this is generally a superficial, unsatisfactory, and fallacious mode of arriving at safe conclusions upon these subjects. I confess my amazement, that it is made the subject of so much consideration in these hearings.

It is obvious, that the statistical tables of *numbers of passengers and tons of freight*, and rates, &c., as generally presented, must be extremely fallacious. If they were made by one person or committee acting impartially and judiciously, some dependence might be placed upon them. But, coming as they do from the parties immediately interested,—made up with every degree of care or carelessness, and under every influence of partiality and self-interest, entirely without any standard by which to compare them, they are to be received with great caution, and often with great distrust.

The distinctions between them, in the present case, cannot have failed to attract the attention of the Committee. All those of the central route, except the returns from Brighton and Brookline, have been carefully made from diligent inquiry and most cautious proof of the numbers of passengers and tons of freight actually transported during the past year; while most of the others have been founded on mere general opinions stated by the witnesses, without any particular inquiry or examination. One may be truly called *statistical* accounts; the other, mere estimates dependent upon the greater or less degree of observation, knowledge, judgment, or imagination, of the witnesses.

It seems to me, that little importance can be attached to this sort of evidence. But there is one species of proof before the Committee that can be safely relied upon; and it is that, alone, on which their judgment may confidently rest. I refer to the relative amounts of population and capital invested in active industry along the proposed lines. *Human nature and the influences of the same industrial occupations are the same every where*—in Norfolk, or Worcester, Massachusetts, Rhode Island, or Connecticut; and where you find any given numbers of people, *manufactories, and workshops*, you may safely calculate upon corresponding capacity and need for a turnpike or a rail-road, and means to maintain it.

Now this, sir, is a view of this case that has been hitherto carefully kept out of sight by those who have preceded me. As I esteem it, however, the only safe basis of calculation and sound judgment, and as the *facts* are *incontrovertible*, so that we know the ground we stand upon, I wish to place it before the

Committee with particular emphasis, as deserving their especial and most careful consideration.

Assuming, then, that the numbers of passengers and tons of freight will always be the same, in the *like amounts of population engaged in like occupations*, and that the prices of transportation must correspond *so as to adapt themselves to the business in all cases*, I now ask the attention of the Committee to apply the principle to the case before them.

Aud, first, as to the population. We have not the means of actual comparison by taking the towns through which the lines of different roads respectively pass; but we have a criterion approximating, and hardly less satisfactory. It is proved that, upon taking all the towns whose centres are within five miles of the line of the road from Boston to New Haven, through Worcester, Springfield, Hartford, and New Haven, and those whose centres are within five miles of the proposed central route, the population along the central route exceeds that of the Western Rail-road route full nine per cent.; and as this comparison cannot be in favor of the central route, through Massachusetts, this increase must be mainly on the residue of the road.

Next, let us turn to the tables showing the relative amounts of capital along the proposed route, and those of several existing profitable roads. The amounts invested in manufacturing and industrial capital are shown to be as follows:—

Proposed route in Connecticut per mile,	-	-	\$56,818 00
Fitchburg Rail-road,	-	-	22,929 00
Boston & Worcester Rail-road,	-	-	57,651 00
Boston & Maine	-	-	51,935 00
Old Colony	-	-	33,854 00

Showing the industrial capital thus employed along the proposed route, in Connecticut, to be greater than that of any other of these routes excepting the Worcester, and only about eight hundred dollars short of that; and more than fifty per cent. greater than that of the Fitchburg;—and, that all this capital must be as near to this line as that along the other roads, is proved by the testimony that the great body of it is WITHIN A MILE OF THE ROAD, and all the residue within five or seven miles. Surely, then, if population and industrial capital are to be relied upon as the basis, the claims of this Connecticut road far exceed the great majority of the best roads in this State.

But the case does not rest here. There is another criterion of the relative amounts of industrial population and capital along these lines—no less emphatic and decisive—to be found in the comparative numbers of manufactories and mills. From the tables it appears that, along the line through Connecticut, there are

more than 6 woollen and cotton mills to every 5 miles;	
On the Boston and Worcester line, 2 in every 5 miles;	
“ Fitchburg, - - - “ 1 “ “ 5 “	
“ Old Colony, - - - “ 1 “ “ 5 “	

That is to say, as *three to one* contrasted with the Boston and Worcester; and as *six to one* with the Fitchburg and Old Colony. Not that all those on the Connecticut line are supposed to be equal, in size or importance, with those on the other lines: but their great number indicates alike the comparatively greater amount of capital thus employed and of population thus engaged. And to this we are to add one hundred and eighty-seven grist and saw-mills,—more than two for every mile.

And this, sir, is the country which we are told is inaccessible and uninhabited, barren and unproductive, and to which access by rail-road is neither practicable nor desirable; *and such are the country, and the water-power, and the spindles, and the people at work, which counsel who count their spindles by fifties, and measure their water-power by gallons, declare to have no occasion for a rail-road, and unable to support one!* And to these are to be added, the one hundred and thirty thousand spindles of water-power, as yet unemployed, within seven miles of this line, at Willimantic.

Such, sir, are the resources of Connecticut, through which the proposed line would pass; and such are the treasures she now offers to our acceptance. A most highly respectable delegation of her citizens have come here, with a charter in their hands for a road through that portion of their own prosperous State, and respectfully request permission to have it united with one through our own: and the question now before the Committee is, Whether they shall be turned coldly and contemptuously away? They come, representing thousands and *tens of thousands of industrious and virtuous men in Connecticut*; and with eleven hundred, of like character, from *Rhode Island*; and with six thousand of your own fellow-citizens,—asking merely the privilege of uniting that region with ours in the bond of friendly and commercial intercourse, that the treasures now possessed by each may be made, in some measure, common to all, as the means of increasing the wealth and prosperity of themselves and their country. Surely such applications as these are not to be slightly regarded or thoughtlessly turned aside.

But, among other equally untenable objections, it has been said, that the road can never be profitable as a *freight* road because it will constantly cross navigable streams where articles may be waterborne, and so transported much more cheaply than upon a rail-road. This is an entire mistake. The road will

cross but one navigable stream in Connecticut, and that is the Connecticut River. It is most essentially an inland route, and therefore most assuredly a profitable one.

Finally, Mr. Chairman, upon this point we have the deliberate and definitive action of the State of Connecticut, which we think should be decisive. She has passed in judgment upon the question, after patient and careful examination, as is abundantly proved. So entire has been the conviction of her legislature, with the matter long and fully before them, that they have granted a bridge across their principal navigable river, notwithstanding one of the best organized and most forcible oppositions ever encountered. Would they have done this, if the road proposed were through a barren, fruitless, impracticable country? Was not every consideration of the *utility* of the road, its *feasibility*, its *profit* and its *state and national* advantages, and all its disadvantages, fully discussed, and deliberately decided upon? Were not these discussions *before men familiarly and practically acquainted* with that region, and with the characters of the witnesses, and their capacities for giving accurate information,—therefore infinitely more competent to appreciate the testimony and arguments as applied to the subject than we can pretend to be? And when the State Legislature most competent to judge, and *most interested to judge correctly, has fully considered the subject*, and has determined that the road should be constructed, because it will be profitable to its owners and beneficial *to the public*, and has evinced the fulness of its conviction by bridging the most important navigable stream within its boundaries,—does it become the Legislature of another state, *with no comparative local information, and with only the feeble light of distant testimony*, to deny the soundness of their judgment or the correctness of their conclusions?

If, Mr. Chairman, we had *much* testimony here, tending to show that the road through Connecticut would not be profitable, I should hold it of very little moment in opposition to this action of the Legislature of that state; because *no evidence* before *this committee* could be supposed, for a moment, to compare, in amplitude or extent, to that adduced before that Legislature; and because it is obviously impossible for a *committee composed of strangers to the territory and the people inhabiting it*, however exalted their judgment or ability, to form so accurate an opinion upon the subject of inquiry, as can those who are familiar with the country—the numbers, occupations, possessions, and habits of the people.

It may perhaps be suggested, that the charter was granted merely with the view of the through travel—to unite Connecticut with New York and Boston. But this cannot be so.—Connecticut is already in full communication with Boston by the

Western road and Norwich road, and with New York by numerous steam-boats, and will soon be so by rail-road from New Haven. She could gain nothing of importance by a mere transit of passengers or freight through her territory in that direction ; and the road, therefore, must have been granted from the proof of its *utility* and *profitableness* in the region *through which it proposes to pass*.

And next let us consider the course of the proposed road through Rhode Island. And here, too, it must become the chain of communication with a great and growing manufacturing and commercial interest, that may be of immeasurable importance if connected with this state and metropolis. The population, business, and water-power of the *north-eastern part of Rhode Island* in the *vicinity of Woonsocket*, have been proved, by numerous witnesses, to be such as to render rail-road communication between that region and Boston of *unquestionable necessity*. That village alone has 60,000 cotton, and 3500 woollen spindles now in operation, and is most rapidly increasing, and has water-power for 36,000 more, making a total nearly equal to one half the water-power of Lowell. It is proved, that there is now water-power, employed and unemployed, equal to 249,448 spindles, within 12 miles of Woonsocket, most of it in Rhode Island, and three-fourths of it *within a mile from the line of the proposed central route* ; and that this is capable of increase at very small expense, making a total of 381,500 spindles ; while the whole water-power of Lowell is stated to be only equal to about 220,000 or 240,000.

This road, therefore, if established, will bring Boston, and the centre of Massachusetts, in direct communication with very many manufacturing establishments already existing, with several large cities and towns, and an extensive agricultural country, and with water-power equal to 630,500 spindles,—all of which must ere long be brought into operation under the enterprising skill and capital which are so rapidly making *New England* the manufacturing emporium of America,—and with none of which have we now any rail-road communication.

Nor ought we to forget, in this connexion, the great probable use to be made of this road, in the transportation of cattle from New York, Pennsylvania, and New Jersey. The testimony shows that many are now driven the whole distance to the market at this end of our route ; and it seems not extravagant to infer that, if a direct and feasible road be made ; vastly greater numbers will be sent in this manner, to the great profit of the State, and the income of the road, besides the great numbers to be brought from Rhode Island and Connecticut.

It is further proved, if the testimony adduced is to be relied upon, that, in comparing the population along the two lines



from Boston to New Haven, exclusive of the termini, that of the Western and Springfield route is less, by 9 per cent., than that of the proposed route, taking towns whose centres are within 5 miles of the two lines; and this could have been most easily disproved, if not true. This, of itself, is sufficient. It proves conclusively, that the road will be at least so much more profitable in way travel, and is so much the more demanded for the public accommodation.

Thus this road, if constructed, will bring us into immediate contact with a great and growing, and most industrious, enterprising, prosperous population, with whom we now have no intercourse, who will buy and sell with us, and infinitely increase our wealth while increasing their own; and also into connexion with extensive manufacturing establishments already existing, and an almost inexhaustible power for their increase, and the profitable investment of our surplus capital.

It seems to me derogatory to the intelligence of the Committee, to offer further comment upon this point. If the evidence before them is entitled to any credit for honesty or intelligence, the result is too obvious for argument; it is a self-evident proposition; and I submit with confidence, that no evidence was ever placed before any committee more entitled to respect and full faith than that on this subject, coming from the highest sources of character, station and intelligence, and without the slightest attempt at contradiction by witnesses or in way but by mere assertion of counsel.

It is to be borne in mind by the Committee that, in our estimates of the income of this road in our statistical tables, we compute it *wholly upon the local business of the road*, taking the existing amounts of freight and passengers, without adding any thing for the certain and great increase that must inevitably result from the establishment of the road, as proved by the annual returns of all the roads in the Commonwealth. We have stricken out the 80 per cent. in the tables from Connecticut, although that may certainly be considered a most reasonable anticipation after the first four years; and *we have not added one cent for any transportation of persons or property from Boston to New York, or to New Haven*; and from those tables it appears that, as a LOCAL ROAD ONLY, IT WOULD PAY  $8\frac{1}{2}$  PER CENT. ON THE COST, *as things now are*. But to this we are to add the natural increase, and which would be greater here than on any other road because of their present total want of any such facilities; and to that we are also to add the through travel and transportation between Boston and New York, which, we believe, may be well computed in hundreds of thousands of dollars in a few years.

I cannot leave this part of the case without reverting to one portion of the argument of the counsel for the Western Rail-

Road—viz., that we should wait until these resources are brought into operation before constructing a road to them.

How long—and to what degree or extent of operation must they arrive? The argument seems much like that of forbearing to cut roads and open means of access to a fertile country until it is settled with towns and villages. But the answer to this argument, if such it may be called, is all around us. We have a great surplus capital every where seeking investment. Our capitalists are building rail-roads in Pennsylvania, Michigan and New York. Why not avail ourselves of these resources for planting it here, amid New England institutions, and protected by her energy, habits and principles? There is no assignable limit but the extent of water-power to the amount of surplus capital that must continue to be annually invested in the manufactories of our country if she continue to advance as she has done. The destiny of New England is determined. She must be the great manufacturing workshop of this continent. And every spindle of water-power must soon be made to contribute its energy to her onward movement; and no policy can be more in consonance with the genius of her people, and their truest interest, than the establishment of the easiest possible means of access to her mill-streams, and of intercommunication between her states, cities, and villages.

I submit, therefore, to the Committee, that my first proposition is clearly made out:—that a rail-road by land from Boston, through Rhode Island, Connecticut, and New York, is alike demanded for the public good and by the public voice; and that, whether considered as affording a *more speedy, regular, and direct communication between the cities of Boston and New York*, or as a *local road merely* connecting Boston with Rhode Island and Connecticut, its expediency for the public, and its profitability to the stockholders, cannot be doubted; and that, viewed as a combination of both, it is not surpassed, in extent of utility and promise of profitable investment, by any that has ever been before the Legislature. And, in behalf of the inhabitants of Connecticut and Rhode Island, and of the 6000 petitioners in Massachusetts whom I have the honor to represent, I invoke your interposition and aid to procure for them this charter.

II. We pass, then, to our second proposition:—that the particular road, prayed for by Otis Pettie and his associates, is the most suitable, if not the only one suitable, for the attainment of an extension through Rhode Island, and is far better adapted than any other for the general purposes of a through route.

My first point under this proposition is, that the route I advocate is the most, if not the only, suitable one for attaining an extension through Rhode Island.

In the first place, Mr. Chairman, it is obvious that the road

cannot be extended as desired without the consent of the State of Rhode Island given in the form of a charter. The success of the project is as entirely dependent upon her will as upon that of this State; and that will must be in the sentiments and wishes of her citizens; and those sentiments and wishes *must be in accordance with their perception of their public and private interests*, and their *sense of the justice and comity* evinced towards them by the *other states interested in the enterprise*. It is not to be asked or expected, that she will construct a conduit through her territories, merely for the purposes of having the treasures of Massachusetts flow through it into Connecticut and New York, and those of New York and Connecticut flow through it into Massachusetts, while she is to be jealously and carefully excluded from all the benefits which she might reasonably anticipate and desire from it. She is under no obligations of justice, *comity, or good neighborhood*, to permit a stream to flow through her waste soil to fertilize Massachusetts and Connecticut,—when, by a course equally direct and beneficial to them, it might be made to fertilize her productive lands, and so add to the mutual comfort and wealth of all of them. Nor are her citizens to be expected to give their votes, or exert their influence, to procure a charter which carefully excludes them from the only benefit they could derive from one if had on just and equal terms. Nor are they to be supposed willing to exert themselves for the benefit of *those who avowedly disregard their interests and seek only the selfish and exclusive gratification of their own*.

These are very obvious and trite remarks, and may seem too plain to need even a statement of them. But they are clearly decisive of the question before the Committee, if applied to the evidence. The proposed road must pass through Rhode Island. *The only point at which it can pass, with any material benefit to her, is Woonsocket*. That is one of her *central points of manufacturing capital*, and enterprise, and expectation. Her interests in that quarter may be greatly promoted by having it connected with the cities of Boston and New York by rail-road communication; and her citizens resident there, and in its vicinity, would be unquestionably greatly benefited, and have every motive of self-interest and State policy to aid and advance the project. That place is now altogether the centre of business in that region; and entitled to retain and enjoy its preëminence so long as fair competition will enable it to do so;—and, of course, not only cannot consent, but must vigorously resist any effort to destroy its importance, or build up another at its expense. But the whole argument of the advocates of the Perkins and Walpole routes, on this point, is, that the road should pass through Blackstone, because that is a Massachu-

setts town,—and Massachusetts interests would be promoted, and Blackstone would soon become the central point of business of that region *instead of Woonsocket*, and outstrip her in the race of competition. And most earnest and pathetic appeals are made to the patriotism of the Committee, and of the Legislature of Massachusetts, to protect the interests of her children, and not those of strangers, or *aliens*, as they are called.

Good names are sometimes used to conceal very bad motives and feelings. Prudence, and love of one's family, are often the cloaks of meanness and inhumanity; and patriotism, that much-abused name and sentiment, is too often the mere flimsy veil thrown over selfishness and passion. It may be very patriotic to protect the interests of citizens of our own State against the *encroachments* of others, or even to advance them in preference to those of others, where no duty of comity or mutual regard interferes. But it is in no sense consistent with my ideas of patriotism, to beg the favor of another state for the benefit of our own, while we deny any participation in it to the party from whom we ask the favor. Nor does it quite come up to my notions of the dignity or self-respect of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, that, in a great enterprise to be undertaken for the mutual benefit of herself and other sister states, *but most chiefly for her own*, she should be seen merely contending to deprive one of them of her just share of the profits by absorbing it herself.

I feel, sir, that, if this were a mere question of dignity and self-respect, there would be no doubts in your minds upon the subject. But it is far otherwise: it is a question of life or death to this whole project. There can be no reasonable ground of expectation that Rhode Island will grant a charter through her territory, unless it be for a road passing through Woonsocket, so as to give her some portion of the advantages which Massachusetts and Connecticut anticipate from it. Her legislators perfectly understand this subject. Their eyes are upon us during this whole investigation. They know, as well as we, the motives and reasons that are here engaged in the effort to turn aside this road from the only point where it could subserve her interests, and make it beneficial only to ourselves, and to her loss: and they will meet such a spirit, if acted out, in the manner it deserves, and spurn the application for a charter through her lands. The people of Woonsocket, who are now united to a man in this enterprise, and have exerted all their influence in their own state to ensure its success; and who entertain no doubt of it, if Rhode Island be allowed a share in its benefits: would, if actuated by the motives common to all men, be as united against it, if they are not only to be excluded from its advantages, but to see a determination on our part to build up

a neighboring village at the expense of their own flourishing town. Human nature is every where the same ; and we have but to appeal to our own hearts to tell us what we should do in like circumstances, in order to learn what they will do. Besides, it is known to the Committee that thoughts are already entertained, in Providence and Rhode Island, to extend the Boston and Providence Road into Connecticut, for the purpose of drawing there the business which we are seeking to draw here by means of this road. And what better argument could the friends of that project have—what more popular one could the opponents of ours urge upon their Legislature—than this selfish, studied design, on the part of Massachusetts, to seek of her the favor of a road through her soil, solely for the purpose of *passing, through it or over it, the treasures* which she might otherwise secure for herself ?

Sir, if either of these roads to Blackstone be chartered, it will be worth no more, for the purposes of a through road to Connecticut and New York, than the paper upon which it is written. Such a charter would be far worse than the refusal of any. It would most justly and forever shut the door of Rhode Island upon us,—and exclude us forever from the rich treasures now within our reach. We should indeed stand like the dog who lost the substance in attempting to seize the shadow ; and the selfishness and meanness of the motives would render the comparison not out of place, though applied to a sovereign state.

But it is worth the while to inquire when and how this sudden outbreak of jubilant patriotism has happened. It is something quite new—quite a recent discovery. Last year were eight petitions before the Committee, and not one terminated in or passed through this village of Blackstone, or rather Waterford, which now seems made the centre of Massachusetts interests and patriotism. All that did not terminate upon the Providence and Worcester road went to Woonsocket. There was the Deane route, terminating at Uxbridge ; the Hastings route, at Woonsocket ; the Dana route, at Woonsocket ; the Pettee route, at Woonsocket ; the Russell route, at Woonsocket, afterwards combined with the Ammadon route along the valley to Southbridge, with a branch to Woonsocket ; the Walpole or Fisher route, to Woonsocket, and the Torrey route, also, to Woonsocket ; and the Miller route, from Dedham to Woonsocket, afterwards united with the Russell and Ammadon. Not one of these was thought of as going to Waterford or Blackstone village.

True it is that the advocates of the Russell, Miller and Ammadon routes, after having combined their forces, threw up their caps, and shouted heartily for Massachusetts interests, and down with Rhode Island ; but that was for a road turning off below the village of Blackstone, and passing through the valley a

long distance to Southbridge, all within this State; and with the express disavowal of any design of a through road, by way of Rhode Island and Connecticut, to New York; and there was therefore some little pretence of reason in calling that a Massachusetts interest—in contrast with a road that was to pass immediately into another state. But no such pretence can be plausibly asserted by the advocates of a road which is intended to pass in the same manner with ours, and with no other difference than the distance of a mile and a half from each other.

But how is it that, if it is so important to go to Blackstone now, and so *unpatriotic to think* of going to Woonsocket,—that this was not found out until this season? Has any change taken place in the relative condition of the two towns? Or any new light beamed upon the benighted eyes of these patriots—so that they can now see what before was not visible? Clearly not. All remains the same relatively; and if it was desirable then that the road should terminate in, or go through Woonsocket, it is so now; and we have the united voice of the whole people of Massachusetts, who then desired any road, that *Woonsocket* was its proper *termination*. Indeed, so clear was this, that it was formally announced by the Committee, on the second or third day of their session, that the necessity of a road to Woonsocket was a conceded point, and need not be matter of evidence; the only question being which road would be most conducive to the public good. And the unanimous response of that Committee was, that the one we now advocate was the best.

How, then, is this change to be accounted for? Clearly enough. It was seen then, and is seen now, that, if any road is to be granted to Woonsocket, it must be that of Otis Pettee and his associates: that all Rhode Island, and the greatest portion of all the petitioners for a road to that region, are in favor of it; and nothing else, therefore, was left to the others but to seek some other termination, about which they could rally with a patriotic hurrah for Massachusetts, expecting to carry the day by that appeal. We have, however, no apprehensions that it will avail. We believe the reasons already stated will suffice to show that it is one to which the Legislature ought not to listen, even if it were true that the pecuniary interest of the state would be promoted by having the road pass through Blackstone village. But we are willing to meet the question upon that issue: we submit that the case is clearly with us beyond all reasonable doubt: that, in a pecuniary point of view, it is for the interest of this State that the road pass to Woonsocket rather than through Blackstone, *whether considered as a local or as a through road*.

In the first place, it is obvious that it can make no great difference to the State at large, so far as the development of *its*

*own resources* is in question, whether it pass through one or the other. If the road be to Blackstone, it will, we concede, be as well for the mere accommodation of that village and the other Massachusetts towns, as if it should go to Woonsocket; and it is equally obvious that, if it pass through Woonsocket, it will afford about equally good accommodation to all those towns except the village of Blackstone, *and will afford to Blackstone itself all the accommodation necessary for the full development of her capabilities of improvement.* If the road go to Woonsocket, it will be only one mile and a half from Blackstone, and connected with it by a rail-road already in existence, or may be connected with it by a branch of only about two miles in Bellingham; and it is absurd to suppose that one spindle less would be put in operation, in the Blackstone valley, by reason of the road's going to Woonsocket rather than to Blackstone. The whole foundation of any increase of population, or capital, or business, in that region, is in the water-power; and all that is wanted are reasonable rail-road facilities for bringing it near to this city. It cannot be moved or changed: people must go and settle down where that is; and it matters not whether the rail-road be a mile or two one way or the other, so long as it is within reasonable reach of all; and to say that it would not all be accommodated by a road passing to Woonsocket, but would be by one passing to Blackstone, is to make the accommodation of the *Blackstone valley* dependent upon a trifling change of location wholly inadequate to any such result. It might affect the growth of that particular village to have the station there rather than elsewhere, by the addition of the persons who attend upon a rail-road station; but not one spindle the less would be put in operation, nor one drop of water-power the less put in requisition, if the road should go to Woonsocket.

But, on the other hand, if this road be made to pass to Blackstone instead of Woonsocket, not only must the stockholders of this road lose the advantage of having it stationed in the centre of population and business of that region, and a corresponding loss to the public must ensue, but the State will lose the business of Woonsocket and its vicinity, and Rhode Island; so that, considering it as a local road merely, to terminate at either of these towns, the pecuniary interest of the road itself, and of the State, demand that it go to Woonsocket.

No person acquainted with rail-road statistics, and having any knowledge of the state of the country, and the actual condition of things there, could hesitate for a moment. Compare the population, factories, stores, resources, of Woonsocket with those of Blackstone; the one the centre of business in that region, growing with great rapidity; the other, a comparatively

obscure place, owned by a few wealthy individuals. If any other charter be granted, no one acquainted with these localities can doubt that the road under it will terminate in Woonsocket, let the present pretences be what they may. It must do so to make it a profitable investment.

But when to this consideration we add, that the business of Rhode Island and Connecticut can alone be secured in this manner, that no road other than the one through Rhode Island can ever be obtained, all other considerations sink into insignificance: for, to charter a road to Blackstone rather than Woonsocket would, in this point of view, be to sacrifice the advantage of connexion with the States of Rhode Island and Connecticut, and the vast business and resources of both, and of the most direct and rapid communication with New York, for the mere purpose of building up one village, owned by a single corporation, whose only members are a few rich men in Providence: and when, if the road should go through Woonsocket, that same village would be almost equally benefited. A more suicidal and short-sighted policy was never suggested for serious consideration.

Another imperative reason for chartering the road to Woonsocket, rather than Blackstone, is in the fact that the termination of it at Blackstone must necessarily occasion the delay of from fourteen to sixteen months in procuring a charter through Rhode Island; and as the Connecticut charter requires that they should commence operations, and expend at least \$500,000, before the expiration of three years, and one year has already or nearly expired, the delay would prove ruinous to the whole enterprise. It is well known that delays of this sort are often ruinous to undertakings dependent so much upon popular will and feeling, and there can be no certainty that the Legislature of Rhode Island or Connecticut, two years hence, will be equally well disposed, or that the affairs of the country will be equally favorable for the undertaking. It is of the utmost importance to secure this great boon now, while within our reach. The delay of twelve or fourteen months may enable rival interests successfully to interfere; Hartford may succeed, in her selfish rivalry, in throwing obstacles in the way; Providence may obtain a road connecting Connecticut with her, and thus for ever cut it off from us; and numerous influences may be exerted, to deprive us of the great treasure now seemingly within our grasp: whereas, if this Legislature should now grant a charter, and one be obtained through Rhode Island, as is most confidently anticipated, there can be no danger of the final success of the whole project.

With regard to the application of the constitutional provision of Rhode Island, applicable to the petition pending there, eminent



counsel in that State have given opinions which are before the Committee, and which, with the provision, we are quite content to leave to their decision; believing that it cannot be reasonably assumed, that a charter could be granted on this petition for a road not passing through Woonsocket. Would not every voter in Rhode Island have acted upon the notion that this was the course proposed, and have voted accordingly at the election? This objection, of inability to unite with a road through Rhode Island, we consider entirely fatal to the Perkins and Walpole routes, as parts of a through road. A refusal to charter the road to Woonsocket, as part of a through road, would entirely alienate many of the friends of the project in Rhode Island, dishearten the rest, and give vastly increased courage and influence to its enemies. It might, indeed, be considered as a voluntary abandonment of the undertaking.

There are other reasons of preference for the Central over the Perkins route, which are more properly subjects of consideration in comparing their relative merits as local routes. Considered as parts of through routes, they are both undoubtedly well fitted, in grades and curvatures and construction, for that purpose; though we think the Central road has peculiar merits in other respects. We leave the Perkins road, therefore, in this part of the case, with the single remark, that its proposal to go to Blackstone is entirely fatal to any prospect or hope of ever becoming a part of a through road.

But it may be argued, that Rhode Island will not, in any event, grant a road through her territory to Connecticut; that she will choose to take this Connecticut business to herself, and conduct it into Providence; and it is said that measures are already in progress for that purpose. This is entirely incredible consistently with the usual comity of States; and probably with her own interest, as the direct connexion of such a central portion of her manufacturing interests, as Woonsocket and its vicinity, with Boston and New York, would probably be more profitable to her than the other course suggested. But it is certainly the true policy of this State not to drive her to that course by our own selfishness and want of comity; and if such danger can be reasonably anticipated, the emergency may be met by giving to Otis Pettee and associates the *road to Woonsocket, with the right, if it cannot be extended through Rhode Island, to go to Blackstone*. This course will be the best calculated to produce a favorable result there, as indicating no wish on our part to exclude Rhode Island from her share of the benefits of the enterprise, but, on the contrary, a disposition to deal fairly and liberally; with the intention, however, of adopting this measure for the exclusive benefit of our own citizens, should she decline the proposal: whereas, the grant of a road to the Perkins petitioners to Blackstone, with leave to go to

Woonsocket, if they cannot otherwise get through that State, would be a declaration of selfishness of purpose, and intention to yield only provided the plan could not succeed, that would as justly and surely defeat the project as the confinement of the terminus to Blackstone alone. Besides, our petition is so framed as to admit of this alternative, whereas theirs is not.

Another objection to the Perkins route, in this connexion, as well as in reference to it as a local road, is the great difficulty and expense rendering it probably impossible to connect it with the circular railway to East Boston, as proposed by Mr. Lewis. A glance at the map shows at once the great advantage of our road in that respect; indeed, any such connexion with the Perkins road seems impracticable comparatively; and, if Mr. Lewis's views relative to the trade between this city and New York, which may result from such connexion, be at all reasonable, (and they are entertained by others familiar with our commerce,) it is of the utmost importance, for it may be the means of restoring to this State a vast commerce that now goes to New York.

Passing, then, from the Perkins to the Walpole and Milford routes, in reference to this question of their constituting parts of a through road, there is another fatal objection to both. The Walpole is equally obnoxious with the Perkins to that above stated; but both this and the Milford are subject to another in common: to wit, that they, as branch roads, are wholly unsuitable to constitute parts of such a through line. It seems obvious, upon the mere statement of the proposition, that a line of over two hundred miles in length, passing between the two greatest cities in this part of the country as its termini, through parts of four States, and a rich manufacturing and agricultural country, with a thickly settled population compared to any other, and the prospects of business warranting the outlay of from four to six millions of dollars, cannot, with any degree of propriety or expediency, be made a branch to any other road, but must have an independent line under its own exclusive management, and with a separate and independent depot. To make it a mere branch to any other road, would defeat one of the objects of such a road, by placing the rate of its speed within the power of another corporation, who could equally affect it by regulations concerning the junction of trains or rapidity of motion on their own road; and also, by putting within their power, to a certain and very injurious extent, *the rate of fare for passengers and freight.*

Take the very case in hand:—It is conceded, on all hands, that this through route, if established, will compete with the Boston and Providence, and Boston and Worcester roads for through travel and freight. The public convenience will re-

quire, that the rate of speed be the greatest and the fare the cheapest possible. But, make this through road a branch of either of them, and who does not see, that they may so manage as to make this the slowest and dearest route; and who doubts that they would do so, if they could thereby secure the travel over their whole lines, instead of having it only over these small sections? The idea of constituting a through road, of this extent, as a branch to another road, is altogether novel and unheard of; and no witness has been found, to say that it would be practicable or useful.

But there is the *strongest and most emphatic* legislation against it. It is but two or three years since the Legislature, acting upon the principle that a long line ought not to be exposed to the inconvenience of being a branch to any other, actually deprived a main road of one of its branches, which it had expended large sums of money to receive and accommodate, and gave it an independent line and depot without compensation to the parent road; and that, too, at an expenditure of over a million of dollars for fifteen miles.

The Boston and Maine road was an established branch of the Boston and Lowell road. That road had incurred great expenses in arrangements and furniture for its accommodation, and was deriving a profit from the business thus introduced upon it. But the Legislature, against its will, and in disregard of its alleged equitable claims, withdrew the branch, and gave it a new line into the city, solely because, from its magnitude, and convenience, it was considered as an independent line and depot. Those who heard or knew of that controversy will not forget the trifling and insignificant inconveniences which were made the pretence for that movement; and now, the same authority is invoked to make a longer and more important line *a branch of a branch* of another existing road.

As before remarked, it is perfectly apparent that the Boston and Worcester, and Boston and Providence roads, have as much business as the public good requires that they should have. They are both constantly expending very large sums of money in most expensive accommodations, and thus increasing their property, while, at the same time, paying large dividends. The business of both is constantly and rapidly increasing, and must continue to do so with augmenting velocity. Their occupation and responsibilities are as great as they can reasonably ask, or as consists with the public safety and convenience; and there is no reason why these, or their resources, should be increased by adding to either of them another long line far exceeding the whole present extent of their own. Is it not absurd to talk of a new line, substantially of 120 miles, as a branch to a road not itself over forty or fifty?

But there is testimony upon this subject of the greatest weight and authority upon such a point. Mr. Gilmore, president of the Western road, has sworn that he has no objection to the chartering of branches, from Woonsocket or Blackstone, to the Worcester or Providence roads; because, if chartered as such branches, *they will not be carried through; but that he is opposed to the chartering of the Perkins or Pettee route, because, if chartered, he believes or fears that they will go through, and interfere with the anticipated business of the Western road*—a very conclusive and practical test of the question.

Another and strong ground of preference for the route prayed for by Mr. Pettee and his associates is, that it is desired by far the greatest number of petitioners in our own State, and nearly all those, interested in a through route, in Connecticut and Rhode Island. The people of Woonsocket are nearly unanimous. The people of Connecticut may reasonably be understood to be so from the fact of their having acted entirely in concert with Mr. Pettee and his associates, and labored long and earnestly in the cause with them, unaided by others, and by their employing the same counsel to urge their memorial, &c.,—although they forbear, with great respect to the Legislature, to express any preference with a view to influence its decision. It would seem marked injustice to deny the privilege to those who first conceived the design, who have faithfully and perseveringly worked for its accomplishment, and give it to those who never aided by a farthing of money or a second of time, and have rather discouraged and hindered than assisted its progress.

III. Our third position is, that the road prayed for by Otis Pettee and others, *considered as a through road*, will not conflict or interfere with the vested rights, or reasonable claims or expectations, of any other chartered or established road. I omit, in this connexion, any reference to any other conflicting rights which may be supposed to exist between this and any existing or projected roads, or between the latter and those already established, reserving those points for consideration when discussing their relative merits as *local roads*.

The only roads interested in the through travel, which is now alone to be considered, are—the Boston and Providence, Stonington, Norwich and Worcester. Boston and Worcester, and Western. Three of these roads appear here as remonstrants, and the other two are alluded to, by all three remonstrances, as in danger of loss from the establishment of that proposed.

Now, it is hardly worth the while to remark that neither of these corporations has, or appears here as pretending to have, any exclusive vested right to the travel between Boston and

New York, express or implied. Such a pretence would be too absurd, and needs no further notice; and it is equally obvious that the proposed road will not interfere with any rational expectations which either of them could entertain of obtaining or retaining any such right or advantage. This is perfectly obvious with regard to the Boston and Providence, and Norwich and Worcester, and Stonington routes, in the first place, because all those routes are sea routes, more than one half the passage being upon the Sound; and as it was not stipulated, so it never could have been understood, that no other rail-road corporation should be established by an entire land route, whenever that should become practicable, avoiding all the dangers, delays, uncertainties and inconveniences of water-passages. For this reason, alone, it would be idle to pretend that any conflict of *right* can exist, whatever there may be of *interest*. Another entire answer is, that the proposed route passes through an entirely new region, not accommodated by either of those routes excepting at one intersection with the Norwich and Worcester road; and this, too, a territory of great manufacturing wealth and enterprise and still greater capacity; and connects them with our own State; and it is absurd to suppose that this region was intended to be excluded from communion with our State and her commercial metropolis, or that they were to be deprived of its trade because a road leading through it would cross at right angles with an existing road; or that such crossing could conflict with any supposed, implied or expressed rights of those two companies.

Whatever effect, therefore, this route may produce upon those roads, no reasonable complaint can be made that it will violate any right, or disappoint any just or reasonable expectation. The only aspect in which this interference can be contemplated is that of *policy* or *expediency*; and the question is, whether the amount of public benefit, to be derived from this route, will counterbalance the damage it may bring upon those roads so far as to require its construction; and this question seems susceptible of very easy answer.

In the first place, one of those roads is entirely in other States, the Stonington being exclusively in Rhode Island and Connecticut; and by far the greatest portion of the Norwich and Worcester in Connecticut; and great portions of their stocks are held in New York, Connecticut, and Rhode Island. Without, therefore, rendering ourselves obnoxious to the imputation of selfishness or unreasonable exclusiveness, it is both just and right, in legislating for this Commonwealth, to preserve and advance our peculiar interests in preference to those of other States when they must conflict. Now, it is perfectly plain, from a glance upon the map, and the statistics before the Committee, that the pro-

posed route will not only afford all the advantages to our State and city which both those roads afford, considered in reference to their great termini of Boston and New York, but that it will, in addition, bring Boston in direct intercourse and communion with a great extent of territory rich in manufacturing establishments already, and every day becoming more so, which neither of those roads now touches, excepting the portion through which the Norwich and Worcester passes at right angles with this. The utmost that the Stonington road now does for Boston is as a communication with New York; it affords not one particle of trading or manufacturing territory. The principal effect of the Norwich road is the same, though it does afford facilities of intercourse with the region through which it passes, that being, however, up in the line of the stream of the Quinnebaug River, and not across the whole range of streams, as the proposed route will be. The advantage, therefore, which the Norwich and Worcester road affords for intercourse with that region, is very trifling compared with that which would enure from the establishment of that now under consideration. No man can doubt, if the question where the road should go were now for the first time agitated, that this is the true route; and the inquiry now is, whether Massachusetts shall lose all the benefits of immediate intercourse with this extensive territory, and the consequent increase of her wealth and prosperity, because other roads were established, under a mistaken policy, or one limited to the views then existing, which cannot afford such intercourse nor accomplish any of the great purposes for which the new road is designed.

In other words, the true question is, whether the State of Massachusetts shall support the Stonington and Norwich roads at her own expense; for it can make little difference whether she pays for their maintenance out of her treasury, or sustains them by foregoing the advantages and increase of wealth that the new road would furnish.

And here it is objected, that this State has loaned to the Norwich and Worcester road four hundred thousand dollars, which will be jeopardized or lost if other roads go into operation. Well, what if this were true? (which, however, it is not:) it by no means follows that the State would be a loser by the operation. She had better lose four hundred thousand than as many millions. Four hundred thousand dollars, if totally lost, is the whole loss, and we know the end of it; but it is a very small sum compared with the wealth flowing into the State from its immediate connexion with any extensive manufacturing regions. Let this road go into operation, and the tide of business of these regions, or any considerable part of it, be turned to Boston, and the four hundred thousand would be repaid in any

one year, and the accumulated and accumulating profits to our Commonwealth would make four hundred thousand dollars as a unit in the computation of gain.

But there is no danger of such entire loss. The State has a mortgage upon the whole road and its equipments, and must be first paid. The road may still do the share of business that justly belongs to it, and be worth that amount, or more, though of less value than now; and the State will be eventually no loser except in the depreciation of the small portion of stock held by its own citizens. Indeed, it is thought that the road would be more profitable if confined to its local business, instead of being involved in steamboat speculations as it hitherto has been; and if the proposed road be established, the Norwich and Worcester, it is believed, will be the great route from New Hampshire, and the central portions of this State, to New York, and probably become far more profitable than it ever yet has been.

The truth is, that the Stonington and Norwich roads were built entirely as routes to New York, *accommodated to the notions of that time*, and, it certainly seems, with very little anticipation of the future. They were not built as affording the most direct and best route to New York, for no examination of that now contemplated, and which obviously is the best, was ever made. They were built as the best that were *then thought practicable*. It was supposed that, being cheap and short roads, they could be subscribed for and erected; and, as steamboat navigation had been so long in use that it was considered as the settled mode, which never could be superseded, the great object of those roads was to furnish the readiest access to and from the Sound. They were, therefore, not chartered or built as the best and most permanent routes to New York, but as expedients adapted to those times and the public sentiment then existing as to rail-roads; and they must be viewed like all other plans or expedients suited to the times when they were adopted,—but which must be necessarily outgrown and superseded by institutions of a later period and more advanced state of public intelligence, enterprise, and wealth.

The enterprises in rail-roads which were thought great things then, are little things now. The improvements in their construction, the comparative cheapness of their erection,—above all, the surprising and even yet daily astonishing results in the facilities they afford, and the unprecedented wealth and prosperity which they are carrying into every region of the country, have given a confidence and energy in enterprises of this sort altogether unknown before; and a rail-road from Boston to New York is an undertaking, now, no greater, comparatively, than one from Boston to Providence or Worcester was, when

those roads were first proposed; and it would be as reasonable to refuse to charter a steamboat company because it would supersede or interfere with sailing craft; or to refuse to charter a rail-road because it would conflict with a stage-coach line, a turnpike, or canal,—as to refuse to charter a great line of direct rail-road communication between the two greatest commercial cities in the Union, and through thickly settled manufacturing and agricultural regions, because, in former days unsuited to the enterprise, one or two other indirect, insufficient, and comparatively unsuitable roads had been established which this might interfere with. Such policy is too short-sighted, too suicidal, for a Massachusetts Legislature.

We have next to consider the remonstrances of the Western and Worcester Rail-road Corporations, which have been filed, and one of which has been printed and circulated with the obvious view of an ex-parte hearing, and to obtain prepossession of the legislative and public mind before the decision of the Committee could be had. These documents are worthy of remark for the tone they assume, and the reasons they assign for the desired refusal of the charters prayed for.

The remonstrance of the Western Rail-road Corporation was first filed, and for a time seemed the only one which it was thought expedient for them all to do battle under; but, as the case advanced, and the claims of the projected routes were probably found to be matters more serious than was at first supposed, at a late day, the Worcester Rail-road Corporation sent in their manifesto, at the same time giving it wide circulation by pamphlet and newspaper. The remonstrance of the Western road, after setting forth the cost, and the interest of the State in its stock, and that the road has paid six per cent. only for the past three years,—not referring, however, to the fact well known, that a large portion of the present holders of its stock bought under par,—proceeds to say that, if deprived of any considerable portion of its business by competing lines, the road must fail to maintain itself without serious embarrassment: and that already an important portion of the annual income is derived from travel between Boston and New York.

It appears, however, upon the testimony, that the past income from that source can never have exceeded \$120 per month, if we understood it correctly; and upon no view of it could the amount be double that sum. One can hardly believe that this is a very important portion of the annual income of a corporation whose income, for the past quarter, exceeded the corresponding one of the preceding year by \$60,000; or that the loss of it could produce very "serious embarrassment" in its operations. After enumerating the existing routes, and the proposed connexion of the present roads with one from New



Haven to New York, the remonstrance proceeds to urge that any difference in the speed, to be obtained by the Pettee route, "can hardly be urged as warranting the outlay of millions for construction of a rival line, which, if completed, must still further depress the roads now doing this business, some of which, as is well known, can now barely maintain themselves."

Here is a pathetic appeal for certain other roads represented as hardly able to subsist; but it comes very strangely from the lips of a corporation which is confessedly about uniting itself with others to take from them all of their custom which it is supposed that the route objected to could take; and thus to reduce existing lines to the same degree of supposed poverty and embarrassment which that proposed is remonstrated against as calculated to produce. It seems to be thought perfectly consistent with humanity and charity for the Western Railroad Corporation thus to take from them their means of subsistence, but very impolitic and unjust for any other corporation to presume to share with her. This remonstrance concludes with advising the Legislature that Woonsocket and Norfolk county will have all the accommodation they are reasonably entitled to by branches into the Worcester or Providence road, and that, therefore, the prayer of these petitioners ought not to be granted. The people of Woonsocket and Norfolk county may be very grateful for the kind intentions which this advice implies, but their own convenience and accommodation are matters about which they respectfully believe themselves to be the most competent judges.

The remonstrance of the directors of the Boston and Worcester Rail-road Corporation is more elaborate, and takes a much wider range. It sets out with an announcement that they consider themselves as representing the interests of the public and of the Commonwealth, so far as they are involved in the management of one of the great lines of communication in the State. It then proceeds to instruct the Legislature in its duty, and the principles it should be guided by in all these cases; and, after representing that the petitioners for the through routes rely chiefly upon the income which is anticipated from the transportation of passengers between the cities of New York and Boston, (a circumstance, by the way, of which they were before wholly ignorant,) proceeds, upon that hypothesis, into an elaborate argument to convince the Legislature of the fallacy of any such reliance.

The first remark applicable to these remonstrances is, that neither of them meets the case before the Committee:—both present false issues:—both have constructed a man of straw, to be battered down at pleasure. It is by many deemed a matter of much regret, that these great and influential corporations

should have adopted the course pursued in this investigation. It was to have been expected, not merely as matter of right, but of duty, that they should present their respective interests fully before the Committee, that they might have their full weight in the balancing of advantages and disadvantages, private and public, to accrue from the grant of either of the charters prayed for; but it was hardly to have been expected that either of them would enter into this contest with the zeal, energy and labor of a competing line:—fighting every inch of ground, and contesting every point, as if its dearest and most sacred chartered rights were at stake, for the sake of protecting a merely incidental advantage of comparatively trifling importance in opposition to the earnest desires and extensive interests of so many individuals, and of the public at large.

Admitting that the establishment of a more direct route would somewhat interfere with the interest of the Western Rail-Road Corporation, is it not one of those incidents to which all corporations are liable, and of which she has no cause of complaint? Was the Western Road originally established with any view to transportation between Boston and New York by a land route? Nobody will pretend it. That road was projected and chartered for a totally different and foreign purpose, *as an avenue to the great West*. The idea of making it a land route to New York never entered any man's head till within a very short time past. It is true, indeed, that anticipations have for years, and perhaps always, been entertained of its obtaining a considerable portion of the transportation of passengers between the cities of Boston and New York, by roads uniting with it from Hartford and New Haven—but it was always in view of their connexion with steamboats to New York—not as a land route. And how is it now that they anticipate any increase? Is it by themselves carrying out and completing any part of the original design of their road, or by constructing any new branch to it, or by expending any money in reference to it, or themselves doing any thing to effect it?

Clearly not: but by the mere accident, that other people, interested in other roads, forming no part of theirs, and not legally or by any necessary interest connected with them, have made, and are making, other roads that go from theirs laterally to New York, by a circuitous route of twenty-four miles out of the direct line. Such connexion and such formation of a land route is therefore a mere accident—a mere contingency—never thought of when their road was chartered; for which they have never paid a farthing or incurred a momentary liability; and to which they are solely indebted for this promised advantage or profit: and for this they come to pray for legislative protection,

and employ eminent counsel to urge their cause with all the seriousness and earnestness with which they would defend a chartered right.

If the case were, therefore, what these remonstrants represent it to be, and our project did depend, as they allege, upon the securing of the principal portion of the through travel between Boston and New York, and its success would deprive them of a portion of this accidental and collateral advantage, it would afford no reason for rejecting these petitions, if the benefits they will confer upon other persons, or the public, would exceed this accidental and trifling injury to that corporation.

And still less is the Boston and Worcester Rail-road Corporation entitled to favorable consideration in this behalf. That road was established merely from Boston to Worcester, a distance of less than fifty miles, with no reference whatever to any continued land route to New York,—or any, the remotest prospect of any,—and has, therefore, no more good or reasonable claim to monopolize or secure that travel than any other rail-road in the state. By a series of happy coincidences, it has become the main trunk of three great branches—the Western, Norwich and Worcester, Nashua and Worcester, and is soon to be of the Providence and Worcester; and, not content with those, is now seeking to assume to itself a fourth, by uniting Rhode Island at Woonsocket, having already extended a branch in that direction, under color of its charter, and waiting only the grant of Mr. Hastings's petition to consummate the act. She is thus possessing, or will soon possess, four great branches leading to other states, including two, and perhaps the most profitable, routes to New York; and is now seeking to defeat all the other projects before the Committee; to obtain another to the valley of the Blackstone. Surely it might be thought that this corporation has its full share of legislative patronage and public favor, and might be content to see others come in for a share of what is left.

The subject has been, thus far, considered as if the object of our road was entirely or chiefly for obtaining the through travel and transportation between New York and Boston, as is assumed by these remonstrants, and on *which assumption they wholly rely*. But this is a totally erroneous view of the subject; and, properly considered, their objections have very little pertinence to the realities of the case in hand.

The great and main object of our proposed road is its local business, the connexion it will establish between this State and *Rhode Island and Connecticut*, along its whole line, bringing us into immediate contact with a large industrial population and country, already rich in manufacturing capital profit-

ably employed, and affording sources for almost indefinite extension.

*Our tables, and the evidence, show that this road will be a very profitable one, throwing aside all regard to through travel between Boston and New York ; and that such travel is to be regarded as an incident only to its support ; so that the true question upon these remonstrances is, whether we shall throw away these treasures, these benefits of intercourse with Rhode Island and Connecticut, for the sake of saving to the Western Rail-road, and the Worcester Rail-road, the modicum of profits which they derive or are anticipating from the travel between Boston and New York. In other words, the true question is, not whether the Commonwealth shall sacrifice one thing for the sake of another, but whether she shall sacrifice the whole and incalculable advantage of rail-road communication with these flourishing regions, from which she is now nearly excluded, for the purpose of securing to two favored corporations the comparatively trifling and unimportant benefit they now derive, or expect to derive, from a monopoly of accidental business, for the accommodation or acquisition of which neither of them was ever created or intended, —and for which they have never expended one dollar.*

But this is not all :—While these remonstrances set forth no sound objection to the proposed road, supposing it capable of maintaining itself from local travel, they, and the evidence in support of them, do furnish very conclusive evidence of the advantages and utility to be derived from it as a through road. The Remonstrance of the Western road expressly states that the new line, if established, will, in any event, compete with the Western road for the through business to such extent that the diminution of its present and particularly its prospective amount will be a very serious loss to that corporation, which it can ill afford to sustain : and the President testified that he should not object to a road, from Walpole or Milford to Woonsocket, because they, *being mere branches, would not go through* ; but that he did object to the *Perkins and Pettee routes*, because, if either reached Woonsocket or Blackstone, it would go through, or he feared it would go through.

This is the clearest and most conclusive evidence of the practicability, importance, and value, of the proposed route. Nobody knows better than that gentleman what roads will and will not go through, and that none can go, as he feared, that will not be profitable : and no one knows better than he that this road, if carried through, could not seriously injure his road unless it was better adapted to the business, and the public wants. We have, therefore, thus indirectly his testimony that

the road is practicable, and would be profitable, and beneficial to the public.

We, therefore, respectfully submit to the Committee, that none of the corporations who have remonstrated against the projected routes, or whose claims in reference to them have been presented or urged, have any just or reasonable cause of objection; that neither of them has, or can with the slightest plausibility pretend to have, any vested right which will be violated or interfered with in the remotest degree, by the establishment of either of the roads prayed for; that no reasonable expectation or claim would be thus frustrated or defeated; and that no pecuniary interests would be affected other than those which are incidental merely to the roads of the remonstrants, or which are of any moment compared with the advantages to result to the Commonwealth, and great numbers of its citizens, from the grant of the prayer of the petitioners.

But here we encounter another remonstrance, made by citizens of this State, inhabiting the borders of the Connecticut River, alleging that the proposed construction of a bridge at Middletown will impede the navigation of the Connecticut River to Hartford, and so increase the rate of freight to that port, and thus constitute an indirect tax upon them on all the merchandise they receive in that direction.

If this Legislature had power to authorize, or prevent, or in any way interfere with, such a bridge, these remonstrances would seem entitled to some little more consideration. But as it is utterly powerless, and can do nothing upon the subject to control the action of Connecticut, it would seem hardly worth our while to waste time upon the subject, if it were now open; and that the proper disposal of the subject would be, to refer them to that tribunal. But, whatever might be our interests or wishes, that matter is now definitively settled. *The Legislature of Connecticut has granted the right to construct the bridge; the charter has been granted; and any interference on our part is hopeless and idle.*

But it may be argued that, unless one of these through routes be established, that charter will not go into effect, and so the bridge will not be built. This, however, is an entire mistake. That road will be built, and will go to Providence, if not permitted to come to Boston; and we are recklessly striving, by this opposition, to divert a great channel of wealth and enterprise into that city, which we may now bring to our own. The evidence proves that movements have already been made in Rhode Island, to this end; that some of her citizens are aware of the immense benefits to be derived from such a line of road; and renders it probable that, unless the boon now offered be promptly accepted, we shall lose it for ever.

Further, we submit that there is no satisfactory evidence that such a bridge would produce any sensible effect upon the navigation to Hartford, *or that it would injure the inhabitants of this State one farthing.* The question of injury to the navigation of the river was most fully and amply inquired into, and discussed, before the Committee of the Legislature of Connecticut, and decided in favor of the bridge, by the Committee and the Legislature, after most thorough and searching examination : and the result ought to be acquiesced in without complaint. Indeed, if the only testimony against the bridge were such as has been adduced here, there could be little doubt what any intelligent tribunal would decide.

But, what seems to us even more conclusive upon this subject, is the fact that not a Massachusetts man engaged in trade has been found to come here *and point out any definite or ascertainable damage*, that would thus be sustained by our citizens, or an *approximation* to any. The principal, if not the only witnesses called, are a few men living in or near Hartford, deeply interested in the controversy and rivalry between Hartford and Middletown ; and the whole appearance and management of the case, on this point, seems to indicate that these remonstrances are movements of the people of Hartford, or of the Western Railroad in aid of its remonstrance, rather than the voluntary action of the citizens of this State.

Further, it will be remembered that the testimony shows that the freight by vessels bound to Hartford, is now about fifty cents per ton higher than that by those to Middletown, which is only fifteen miles below by the road ; which would go very far to pay the additional expense of transportation from Middletown, if hereafter the goods should be landed there. The Committee have the charter granted by the Legislature of Connecticut before them, and have seen how ample are its provisions for the free navigation of the river and the entire indemnity of the owners of vessels for even slight interruptions, and cannot, we think, be influenced by any proofs before them, and after the action of the State most deeply interested in the subject, by any apprehensions of injury to our citizens on that river, to deny the prayer of the petitioners.

Having thus submitted our views upon the establishment of the proposed road as a portion of a line through Rhode Island and Connecticut to New York, and endeavored to prove its great importance in that point of view, we now ask the attention of the Committee to the consideration of it as a local road between Boston and the Blackstone valley.

IV. Our proposition is, that a road from Boston to the line of the State, for the purpose of connexion with Woonsocket on the route prayed for by Otis Pettie and others, *considered as*

*a local road only from Boston to Woonsocket*, is required for the public good and would be profitable to the owners. The statistical results of such a road are exhibited in table of the central route, No. 1; and, if sustained by the proofs, show a profit of 10 per cent. upon the cost of a merely local road,—or 8 per cent. upon that of a road built in the most thorough manner for a through road: and, if we take the estimates of the Perkins route as our guide, and embrace towns enumerated there, the business of which would, with equal certainty, come upon our road, we have more than 13 per cent. on the cost of a local road, and more than 11 per cent. on that of a road adapted for a through road.

I do not understand that any attempt is made to impeach the items of income here relied upon, so far as the number of passengers and of tons of freight is represented. The estimates of the Perkins and Walpole routes represent an excess over ours of the number of passengers from the Blackstone valley. We are therefore within reasonable bounds at that end of our line. From that valley down to Medfield inclusive, there is an entire coincidence in all the statistics of the several roads, and no reason to doubt their accuracy or safety; as they were all proved by us as *statistics*; and, in no part of the case, has the evidence been more full and satisfactory, or more carefully sifted, than in that relating to the residue of our route through Dover, East Needham, Newton Upper Falls, and Newton Centre,—the only items not established by plenary statistical inquiry being those of passengers from Brighton and Brookline, which the witnesses from this town may have overrated. They, however, are certainly far less extravagant than those of West Roxbury, Jamaica Plains, and Roxbury, and, if we deduct one half, it will not sensibly affect the result of our tables. Nor can it be necessary, after the full argument of the counsel for the Perkins road, for me to urge the obvious necessity of an independent road for the business of the Blackstone valley and the intermediate towns;—and that any branch road will be inconvenient and unsuitable, if not entirely insufficient. The Blackstone valley, and the towns from Southbridge to Woonsocket, constitute one great region, or family of towns, containing in itself resources and existing establishments sufficient for, and demanding, an independent road; and no accommodation by branches can ever properly supply the general necessities.

All these towns are, or must soon become, of such magnitude, by the development and use of their capacities for manufacturing purposes, as to require the accommodation of rail-road communication with Boston; and that end can be attained only by branches extending from each to the Worcester or

Providence Rail-roads, or by an independent line running through and connecting them all together.

The expenses of constructing all the branches that would thus become necessary, it is believed, would exceed that of building an independent line through them, as such branches would combinedly present a much greater length of line and variety of surface; and the same cause would operate to render them more expensive to those using them in reference both to time and money; while, at the same time, such a system would deprive those towns of that direct, easy, and regular intercommunication between themselves, which would effectually conduce to the growth and prosperity of them and of intervening places.

From the evidence before the Committee, it is apparent that the Blackstone valley alone, with the towns intervening between it and this city, will amply support an independent road, and render it alike profitable to the owners, and advantageous to the Commonwealth; and common foresight seems to demand its establishment, whether considered in reference to the accommodation of the citizens of this State alone, or the probability of its future extension into other regions. If it be granted to the line of the State, it will, ere long, be extended along the valley and thence towards Southbridge, and be of itself as useful and profitable, to say the least, as most of the roads now existing; and if it be connected with a line, through Rhode Island and Connecticut, to New York, receiving that along the valley as a branch, it is confidently believed that none existing, excepting the Western, will vie with it in importance, and none exceed it in profitableness to the stockholders. And when to these considerations are added the extremely important accommodation it will afford to the towns of Bellingham, Franklin, Medway, Medfield, and Dover, now entirely without rail-road communication with this city; and the great additional facilities it will afford to the towns of Needham, Newton, Brighton, and Brookline, without interference with the legal interests of any other road, it is confidently believed that rarely, if ever, was a more convincing and commanding exigency for a road presented for legislative consideration: very little effort, indeed, seems to have been made to impeach the statistical tables except by detracting from the rates of fare charged, but the point of main attack has been the computations of cost of construction, which, it is said, are underrated.

This is a question, the solution of which depends entirely upon the capacity and integrity of the engineer who has made them. He alone can know and disclose the nature of the soil and excavations, the length of hauls, and facility of using waste materials, and the numerous incidental advantages and disad-



vantages attending the construction of the particular road. Comparisons with other roads, or computations, are no safe guide, though undoubtedly affording light.

No attempt is made to disparage the capacity or integrity of Mr. Parrott. His plans, profiles, and report, speak for themselves as to his capacity; and his estimates have not been impeached by any direct or satisfactory evidence. The comparison made by Mr. Laurie, in the tabular statement put in, is rebutted satisfactorily by that of Mr. Parrott; but if we were to make every addition suggested which is absurd, as there are many in reference to things that admit of no comparison, and put our road at \$1,312,308, the estimated cost of the Perkins road, the income would still pay a large profit above the interest. If these estimates are not reasonable, there have been certainly able engineers enough here to detect and expose their fallacies or errors, and the Committee know enough to see, by the plans, profiles, and reports, whether they indicate capacity. But a moment's consideration of the objections urged will suffice to expose their futility. What are the mistakes that the counsel attempts to point out? It has been said, indeed, that other engineers put double the estimates of Mr. Parrott upon some of the work. But this is mere imagination: there is no such evidence and nothing approaching to it. The only material differences are in the computed cost of one cutting where Mr. Laurie charges a shilling, and Mr. Parrott twelve and a half cents per cubic yard; and in one rock excavation, which Mr. Laurie puts at one dollar, and Mr. Parrott at eighty cents. But Mr. Parrott has examined these localities and Mr. Laurie has not. The difference in their computations of the cost of the earth excavations is accounted for in the fact, that Mr. Parrott found that a large portion was sand and soft gravel, which Mr. Laurie supposed all hard earth; and in that of the rock excavation Mr. Parrott had found it soft and shakey, in which opinion he is confirmed by the testimony of Mr. Lee.

The testimony of Mr. Cheeseborough was concerning a cut for the water-pipes for supplying the city, very narrow, and at a depth of thirty feet below the proposed bed of the road, and he expressly stated, that it was no criterion whatever for computing the cost of excavation for a rail-road. Although Mr. Parrott may have never entirely constructed a rail-road, he has had great experience in the making of roads and bridges, and in other great works for the State of Maine, in the superintendence of whose public works he was employed by the government; and, for the purposes of computing the expenses of cuttings, excavations, and embankments, the knowledge thus acquired is as perfect and reliable as if acquired on a rail-road; and while his partner, with whom these estimates were made,

has always been, and is now, exclusively devoted to rail-road engineering.

It is respectfully submitted, therefore, upon the evidence before the Committee, that, if the project of a through road be considered unadvisable either as not demanded by any sufficient exigency, or as involving a disproportionate expense, or as interfering with existing interests, nevertheless, a road from Boston to the Blackstone Valley is required by the public necessities, and will immediately be alike profitable to the owners and the Commonwealth.—And we are thus brought, no doubt most happily for the patience of the Committee, to the consideration of our last proposition, which is,—

V. That the road prayed for by Otis Pettee and others, considered as a local road only, is far preferable to any other proposed, in reference to the combined elements of extent of public accommodation, expense of construction, and freedom from interference or conflict with the vested rights or reasonable claims of other existing roads:—

1st. As to extent of public accommodation. This road embraces a greater number of towns within this State not now accommodated by rail-road communication, with access to and from the city,—which is of course the chief object, than any other road before the Committee. It passes through Blackstone, Bellingham, Franklin, Medway, Medfield, Dover, Needham, Newton, Brighton, and Brookline,—in all, ten towns; of which six, viz: Blackstone, Bellingham, Franklin, Medway, Medfield and Dover, have no accommodation whatsoever;—and also, through Newton, at the Upper Falls, a most important and flourishing manufacturing settlement, not now accommodated; and which cannot be, but by a circuitous route of about fourteen and one-half miles by the Worcester road in place of one of only about eight miles by the proposed road; and the only road now existing through any part of Brookline, is at the northeasterly edge of the town, affording not the slightest accommodation whatsoever; this, therefore, must be added to the six, making seven towns to be thus benefited who have now no such advantage, and are suffering comparative obscurity and injury from that deficiency. Now, strike out Blackstone, which is common to all the routes, and it appears, from the tables, that the towns above enumerated, together with Newton Upper Falls and Centre, present 102,627 passengers, who will be accommodated by the road I advocate.

Let us then, compare the extent of this new accommodation with that of any other line proposed. The Milford route will accommodate Mendon and Blackstone only, and, taking out Blackstone, it accommodates but one town only, not already in the enjoyment of this privilege, and a town of very limited

population and business, and adjoining Milford, where there is a rail-road almost as near to its centre as that proposed. Indeed, it is difficult to see who can want that road, except the people of Mendon and the Worcester Rail-road Corporation. The inhabitants of Blackstone and Woonsocket, do not want it. Those of Blackstone are united to a man in favor of the Perkins route, and those of Woonsocket, with great unanimity, in favor of the Central. As to any new accommodation it will afford to the inhabitants of this State, it is utterly insignificant, of no moment whatever. To connect that branch of the Worcester road with Woonsocket or Blackstone would be a forced marriage, and can never prove a happy one. The people of that region reject the union, are averse to it, and it can only tend to alienate them from union with this city and State.

Next, turn to the Walpole route. The only towns that will accommodate, not already supplied, are Wrentham, Franklin, Bellingham, and Blackstone. Four only; and the number of passengers for all excluding Blackstone, are 17900; a little exceeding one sixth the number to be accommodated by our road.

Next, consider the Perkins route. It passes through seven towns in all. The number of towns to be accommodated, through which no rail-road now passes, or is chartered, are five, viz., Blackstone, Bellingham, Franklin, Medfield, and Medway, being two less than the Central route. Strike out Blackstone, and the number of passengers from towns not now accommodated, which would be so by that road, is 32,131—being less than one third of that by the Central route: and if we strike out Brookline altogether, it would still leave a balance exceeding 60 per cent. in our favor. The number of towns, therefore, to be accommodated by the respective lines, are as follows:—

By the Central road,	-	-	-	ten;
" the Perkins,	-	-	-	seven;
" the Walpole,	-	-	-	four;
" the Milford,	-	-	-	two.

Those to be thus supplied, through which no road now passes, are as follows:—

Central,	-	-	-	seven;
Perkins,	-	-	-	five;
Walpole,	-	-	-	four;
Milford,	-	-	-	two.

Passengers from towns not now accommodated with roads through them:—

Central,	-	-	-	101,133
Perkins,	-	-	-	32,121
Milford,	-	-	-	
Walpole,	-	-	-	17,900

If we take the comparison of the accommodation for freight, as appears by the tables, the disparity in favor of the Central route is equally obvious. The freight on the Perkins route, below Medfield, is stated at 7870 tons—a large portion of which must now go by the Boston & Providence road; while that on the Central route, below Medfield, is found to be 17,394 tons.

There can be no doubt, therefore, that, if the extent of public accommodation, in furnishing facilities of intercourse between this city and the towns within the State, be alone considered, the Central route would afford more than three times the amount of the Perkins route, nearly *six times that of the Walpole*, and twenty times that of the Milford. Indeed, a glance at the map shows that this must be so; and that, considered in relation to other existing roads, and the hitherto unaccommodated portions of the Commonwealth, this road is loudly called for by that region.

It appears, from the evidence, that the income on the Central road below Medfield is computed at \$47,711, on business *which either of the other routes would leave entirely without accommodation, being an income upon nearly \$800,000.*\*

The next subject of consideration, in comparing the relative advantages of these several routes, is the amount of water-power employed and unemployed in the towns through which they will respectively pass; and it is respectfully submitted that, upon the evidence, it appears that a very far greater manufacturing interest, already existing, is found along the Central route than upon any other, and with much greater capacity for augmentation by means proved to be entirely practicable, and now in contemplation; and there can be no doubt that, upon the construction of the proposed rail-road, they would all be put into immediate requisition. If the results of the evidence are as represented, the whole quantity of water-power in the towns of Bellingham, Medway, Medfield, Dover, and Newton Upper Falls, with the means of increase by artificial reservoirs, and the auxiliary use of steam in the same ratio, as resorted to at the Waltham factories, on the same stream, but which can only be adopted if rail-road facilities exist, *would be equal to 96,880 spindles—nearly the whole of which would be left unaccommodated by the Walpole or Milford routes, and more than two thirds of which would be so left by the Perkins route.*—In reference, therefore, to this view of the subject, there can be no question that the Central route would be by far the most useful and profitable.

But here we are met with a claim, on the part of the Walpole and Perkins routes, to a decided preference, upon the ground of alleged superior facilities which they are said to afford for the accommodation of the county of Norfolk, in access

\* See note on p. 61.

to and from the shire-town. This has been much dwelt upon, and greatly magnified.—The case has been argued as if those two routes alone afforded any such means of access to the shire-town, whereas, it is a part of our plan, as prayed for, to have a branch from Dover or Needham to Dedham for that purpose; which will afford reasonable facilities, not merely for those towns in the upper part of the county now without them, but for those in the lower portion, also, who are now totally destitute. So that, in truth, the Central route will afford a greater extent of accommodation than either of the others.

This, however, is a question of purely local interest, to be settled by the people of the towns who are supposed to require this accommodation; and a very large majority of them are in favor of the Central route. So far as this interest is affected by the Walpole route, it applies only to these towns—Wrentham, Franklin, and Bellingham—not now having a rail-road to Dedham; and the population to be thus accommodated in that respect is very small. Of the inhabitants of *those towns*, who appear here as petitioners, 321 only are in favor of that route, while 268 are in favor of the Central route, 0 in favor of the Perkins, showing no decided majority, if any, in favor of the Walpole route in the only towns it can claim.

The Perkins route will afford this benefit to four towns not now enjoying it—namely, Bellingham, Franklin, Medway, and Medfield. But, of the petitioners from those towns, 786 are in favor of the Central route, and 283 only for the Perkins—or nearly as three to one.

The Central route will afford this benefit to seven towns not now enjoying it—Bellingham, Franklin, Medway, Medfield, Dover, Needham and Brookline; and, taking all the towns above Dedham not now having rail-road communication—say, Bellingham, Franklin, Medway, Medfield, Dover and Needham, and we have 1158 petitioners for the Central, and only 283 for both the other routes—or more than 4 to 1.

Again:—if we take the aggregate of petitioners in the whole county, we have 1498 for the Central route, of which 207 are in or below Dedham, leaving 1271 interested in this question; and 913 for the Perkins, of which 814 are in Roxbury and Dedham, already in immediate rail-road communication with Dedham, or residing there, and no more properly to be computed in this inquiry of shire-town accommodation than the inhabitants of Boston; and, deducting these, there remain 99 only against 1271—about 13 to 1; while, for the Walpole route, the aggregate is 767, of which 269 are in or below Dedham, and which, being deducted, leave 498 only against 1271. So that, in whatever aspect the relative merits of these routes is viewed, as affording accommodation to the county of Norfolk, it is incontrovertible that, so far as the inhabitants are

judges, *the decision is in favor of the Central route by an overwhelming majority*, and what more certain, safe, and effectual mode could be adopted to determine that question than its *submission to the people themselves?* And, let it be remembered, that the petitioners on the route I represent are, as I am instructed, all *legal voters*, who would be alone competent to act upon and decide the question, if submitted to the people; while those for the other routes are not thus qualified to act or to judge.

We respectfully submit, therefore, that, so far as the question of county accommodation is involved, the Committee cannot hesitate in giving a prompt and decided preference to the Central route.

There is another most important element of consideration, in determining upon the relative merits of the several roads, which I beg leave briefly to submit to the Committee; namely, the relative extent of collateral roads, or branches, which must be built to effect the same degree of public accommodation. If the Central road be constructed, it will be of thirty-five and three quarter miles in length, and with a branch to Dedham of four miles, making, say forty miles in all, and will accommodate all the towns in Norfolk County not now provided with rail-road facilities to Boston and the shire-town, and without means of intercourse with each other.

But, to produce the same result, if the Milford route be established, will require nine and a half miles for the proposed branch; five for one to Medway; two from Newton Lower Falls to the Upper Falls; four from Dover mills to the Worcester road; and two from Brookline,—making twenty-two and a half miles, and still leaving Bellingham, Franklin, a large part of Medway, Medfield, Newton Centre, and Brookline, entirely without this accommodation, and with none for any of them to their shire-town.

If the Walpole route be adopted, it is to extend seventeen and a half miles. To this must be added one of four miles to Medway, and three to Wrentham, as shown by its advocates; two to Newton Upper Falls; four to Dover Mills and two to Brookline, to connect with the Worcester Rail-road,—making thirty-two and a half miles of rail-road, leaving Medfield, East Needham, and Newton Centre, unaccommodated, and four towns without communication with the shire-town.

And if the Perkins route be adopted, it will require the branches to the Worcester road from Dover, from Newton Upper to the Lower Falls, and from Brookline, being eight miles; which, added to the line, would make forty-three miles, and still leave three towns unaccommodated by communication with Dedham.

If these views be correct, as they are believed to be, it fol-

lows, that the Central route will furnish far greater accommodation throughout its course than any other; combining that of access to this city, and to the shire-town, to a great extent, wholly unattainable by any system of branches that can be devised, and with a great saving of expenditure for the ends most desirable; while, at the same time, it will afford the best possible main trunk for the extension of a branch up the Blackstone valley and the towns in that direction, and for the continuance of the line through Rhode Island and Connecticut to New York, if that great and most important end shall prove, as it is confidently believed to be, attainable.

Any further comparison of the relative merits of the Perkins and Central routes may seem superfluous: but as much stress has been laid upon the advantages and disadvantages of their proposed termini, both as affecting their respective claims to preference, and the expediency of chartering either of them, it may be worth the while to give to them a few moments' consideration.

And, first, as to their termini at the southerly line of the State:—The Perkins line is to end at Waterford, a little village in the town of Blackstone, and about a mile from the village of that name. The line of the Central route is to pass the line near to Woonsocket, with a view to be extended into that place, being about a mile and a half from Waterford.

Now, let us contrast these two places as suitable places for the termini of a rail-road from Boston. If the villages of Waterford and Blackstone be taken together, though they are nearly as far asunder as Waterford is from Woonsocket, it will appear that they contain only about one hundred dwelling-houses, whereas Woonsocket contains between 400 and 500; that they have only four stores, or shops, while Woonsocket has between 60 and 70; that their population combined is not above 2,650, including farmers and others, while that of Woonsocket exceeds 5,000, composed almost entirely of manufacturers and traders: that the water-power in Waterford is equal to from 12,000 to 25,000 spindles, *three fourth parts of which are situate in Rhode Island*; and that in Blackstone is from 50,000 to 60,000, *owned entirely in Rhode Island*; while Woonsocket has water-power equal to 96,000 spindles: that, in Woonsocket there are forty-eight owners of the water-power, and many who hold long leases; while, at Blackstone, the whole is owned by a single wealthy company in Rhode Island; and in Waterford all is owned by one individual: that Woonsocket has, in addition, three large manufacturing establishments turned by other streams than the Blackstone River; seven machine and tool shops; two iron foundries; a quarry of iron stone for furnace hearths, the best known in this country, and beds of iron ore,

of the richest quality, entirely inexhaustible;—and that the road, if extended through Woonsocket, as proposed, will, in the course of thirteen miles, penetrate a region of water-power now equal to 249,448 spindles, and capable of being increased, at very trifling comparative expense, to 385,000,—more than three fourth parts of all which is within three fourth parts of a mile of our line.

It is humbly submitted, that no reasonable doubt can exist of the expediency of adopting Woonsocket as the terminus of any road that may be constructed in that direction, even if a local road, to terminate within this State, were the only object; and that such will be the main dependence of any that shall be authorized, let the language of the several petitioners be what it may; and that, considered in reference to a road through Rhode Island, this is the only route which can afford any hope of success.

And it is believed, that the advantages of the Central route over the Perkins route, in reference to their proposed termini in Boston, are hardly less apparent and decisive, considered in reference to expenditure, injury to private property, and convenience of their depots. In estimating the relative cost of each, we take the Perkins route from the Dedham turnpike to and including the depot at South Cove; and the Central route from the crossing of the Worcester Rail-road to and including its depot near to the Western Avenue.

The cost of the Perkins route, including road crossings, by the estimates furnished to me, cannot be less than \$526,000, while that of the Central route will not exceed \$264,897. The Perkins route passes, for a great portion of the way, through a thickly settled region, crowded with buildings, and through or near to many valuable country seats, requiring the sacrifice of one or more houses and producing incalculable annoyance and inconvenience to numerous families and the public, and greatly impairing the safety, comfort, and pleasure of riding in a portion of the country much frequented for that purpose; while the Central route, on the contrary, goes through a part of the country near to the city, as yet almost entirely unoccupied by buildings,—passing, as far as has been shown, near to one house only to which it can occasion any inconvenience or discomfort, and occasioning, therefore, comparatively no injury to individuals or the public. It does not, like the Perkins route, derange and break up existing establishments, and gardens, and family arrangements, and pleasant neighborhoods; but passes through a vacant region, in which all the uses of the lands may be readily made to correspond with the location of the road. The only estate which has been represented here as liable to be particularly injured, is that of a highly respected



gentleman, the owner of a farm in Brookline, intended to be sold in building lots upon a plan exhibited. But he has not urged any remonstrance against the road, and would not do it, being himself a petitioner for the Perkins road, which is designed to pass not merely through other persons' valuable lands, but through or close by the houses and gardens in which they dwell. Nothing has been done upon that estate which this road will disturb, excepting the erection of the house referred to; and the alteration of the plan in correspondence with the road will be no irreparable calamity.

The land through which the Perkins route passes is estimated to cost from six to fifty cents per foot: that which the central route will cross, is computed at about 1000 or 1500 an acre, for a portion of that nearest to the city and at much less for that beyond. The Perkins route will cross eight roads and several at grade: the Central, but one, and that above grade. The Perkins route crosses with a bridge the navigable waters of Boston and Roxbury, the Central route, none. The Perkins route enters into a thickly crowded, confused, disagreeable, and inconvenient portion of the city: the Central into the most spacious, beautiful, and commodious part, not yet occupied, affording every means of present and future accommodation.

Another most important point of comparison, is their respective relations to other established rail-road routes. It cannot be considered a violation of the rights of any existing rail-road corporation, that another road, called for by a public exigency, should pass near to it, or even through the same towns in the immediate vicinity of this city,—if such course is essential to the construction of such new road; because this being the central starting point, all that proceed from it must, for some distance, be in near proximity to some other. But it is obviously inconsistent with the reasonable expectations, if not the legal or vested rights, of another corporation, to authorize the construction of another road near to or parallel with its own, and thus to divert a portion of the custom in reference to which it was constructed, and upon which it relies for maintenance,—when such new line is nearer than the exigency requires—or is continued so further than is absolutely necessary.

Now, we submit that this is clearly the case with the Perkins route, which runs in close neighborhood with the Boston and Providence from Boston to Dedham, and is continued with equal proximity to the branch chartered to Walpole, to the distance of fifteen miles from the city—passing not only through the same towns but so near as necessarily to divert a large portion of the transportation which was one of the declared objects for the chartering and construction of these roads; while, from the map surveys exhibited last year, the latter of which is now

before the Committee, it appears that another route, avoiding this interference with Dedham and the Walpole Branch, is practicable, and was that then desired; and the Boston and Providence Rail-road corporation has presented an earnest remonstrance against this proposed violation of their rights. The Central route, on the contrary, passes no nearer to any existing road than its course between its termini necessarily requires—scarcely conflicting at all with the interest of the Boston and Worcester, to which it is nearest, and only at points where it now affords no reasonable degree of accommodation compared with that proposed. The inspection of the plan, and recurrence to the evidence, must satisfy the Committee, that no complaint could reasonably be made by the Boston and Worcester Rail-road Corporation on this subject; and their entire silence upon it, in the elaborate and earnest remonstrance which they have presented, sufficiently proves their consciousness that none can be urged with propriety.

It only remains to consider the objections made to the depot, in this city, as too distant and limited, and as injuriously affecting that portion of the city and the Western Avenue. With regard to its distance from the centre of the city, assuming the Old State House to be such for business purposes, the Committee have seen that much exaggeration has pervaded the arguments. For foot passengers, the walk is shorter, and infinitely more agreeable, than that to many others; and, from the weight of evidence, it is apparent that no additional cost would attend the transportation of goods; and if the freight depots should be constructed in Charles Street, between the church and the bridge, as may easily be done, the distance will not much exceed that of others.

With regard to the extent and degree of accommodation which this locality will afford, none in the city can be considered comparable to it. The space is now wholly unoccupied by ways, or streets, or other incumbrances, and free, therefore, to be laid out and disposed of as the necessities or conveniences of a depot may require. About three acres are proposed to be devoted to the passenger and freight houses, being as much ground as the Boston and Providence Corporation has used until within a very short time; and 4 acres to the engine and car houses and workshops,—which are amply sufficient. To these may be added, an indefinite extent of land and flats, between the depot and the bridge, if the necessities of the establishment should require it, and at very moderate prices. Nothing has seemed more frivolous and unfounded than objections of this nature made to this location. It may be, without fear of reasonable contradiction, asserted, that no place within the city affords so ample and convenient accommodations, for the construction of a rail-road depot, as this.

In reference to the injury to be done to Beacon Street and the Common, it is very obvious, from the testimony and the nature of the case, that very little, if any, will accrue. All the heavy freight will pass along Charles Street, either to the north or south; and most of the passengers must take those directions to reach the thickly settled portions of the town. Comparatively, very few, excepting those on foot, will pass through Beacou Street; and those will generally seek the shade of the trees, along the mall, and thus enjoy a luxurious refreshing walk without disturbance or offence to the most fastidious.

Nor is there any reasonable ground for the highly colored representations and poetic terrors in which gentlemen have been pleased to indulge concerning the apprehended dangers and inconveniences alleged to be consequent upon the construction of a rail-road so near to the Western Avenue. That it may somewhat mar the beauty of the view for a mile, and interfere with the present comparative seclusion of the drive, is undoubtedly true. And this is certainly to be regretted, as are all such sacrifices of taste and luxury to the rolling tide of population and business. But they are inevitable,—mere dew-drops in the onward march of society.

The apprehension that any danger will accrue to travellers from their horses becoming frightened by the noise and sight of the engines and cars, is very satisfactorily put at rest by the experience at Craigie's bridge, to which the Lowell Rail-road *runs much nearer*, upon an average, as appears by the plan presented, than will the proposed road to this avenue; as, also, by that at the Warren Bridge, so near to the line of the Boston and Maine Rail-road, and to which the Fitchburg road is probably to come much nearer. It is to be remembered, that a part of the plan is to erect such barriers or screens, as may be thought proper by the proprietors of the avenue, for the protection of travellers, until houses shall have been erected. And if the proposed proximity were too great, the Legislature might require the road to diverge farther north, as it approaches the city. It might seem a sufficient answer to this objection, to remind the Committee, that there can be no reasonable apprehension of any such danger, inasmuch as the scheme meets the *entire approbation of the proprietors of the avenue; who depend mainly upon its tolls for its support*,—and cannot be supposed willing to consent to an arrangement which would destroy, or seriously impair, its income from that source.

I have thus endeavored, Mr. Chairman, and gentlemen, to discharge the duty imposed upon me, of presenting the views of those whom I represent upon this interesting and important question, upon the evidence as it lies before you, and which I suppose to be the ground upon which your decision will rest. If

it shall have satisfied you as the petitioners confidently hope, that a road, through Rhode Island and Connecticut to New York, may be practicable and expedient, I can hardly suppose it doubtful that you will charter the route which I advocate as that best entitled to favorable consideration as constituting the portion of it that shall pass through this State.

If, however, you be not so satisfied, or if doubts rest in your minds concerning it, I respectfully submit that, as a local road merely between this city and the valley of the Blackstone, the central route will be productive of much more extensive and varied usefulness, and is much more earnestly sought for by the people most interested in the result, than any other: that, if chartered, it will not only thus transcend all others in local usefulness and importance, but is the only one that can secure an opportunity of a line through Rhode Island and Connecticut, if future inquiries and proofs shall hereafter further demonstrate its feasibility and importance; but which may, and probably will, be otherwise irrevocably lost.

To these are to be added, the consideration that a *charter* for this route will not conflict with any legal or equitable rights of the proprietors of any other, while it will gratify the earnest desires of a large portion of the most respectable citizens of the Commonwealth:—and, that if the road shall not be constructed under such charter and so satisfy what is now deemed to be a great public necessity, the failure will injure no one, while it shall put to rest the desires that have so long agitated, and, if unheded, threaten still further to agitate, the public mind and the halls of Legislation with harassing controversies.

And having thus humbly performed my task, with many thanks for the patience with which you have listened, I leave the subject in your hands.

#### NOTE BY PETITIONERS.

On the Central or Pettee route, the annual income from way business of places below Medway inclusive, as the transportation now goes with the business to Brighton, is \$102,020 00, equal to six per cent. interest on \$1,700,333 00; *none of which business is met by the Walpole route.* Therefore, if the Walpole route were built, will not this, with the large business from Connecticut and Rhode Island, have, ere long, to come over a road along this Central route to an independent deep-water depot in Boston?

# CENTRAL ROUTE,

PETITIONED FOR BY OTIS PETTEE AND OTHERS.

TABLE No. 1.

Amounts of Freight and Passengers, *per annum*, as at present existing on the Line, to be transported over the proposed Rail Road from *Boston to Woonsocket*, by way of Newton Upper Falls, Medway, &c.

TOWNS, &c.	Miles from Boston	Number of Tons Freight per annum.	Rate per Ton.	Amount of Receipts for Freight, per annum.	Number of Passengers per annum.	Rate of Fare.	Amount of Receipts for Passengers.	Totals for Freight & Passengers.	ANNUAL AMOUNT OF BUSINESS.
Woonsocket,	35	11,000	\$ c.	\$	22,812	1,05	\$23,952	\$	\$2,660,643 in 1845.
Manville,		100							
Waterford,		1,400							
Blackstone,		800							
Millville,		1,000							
South Mendon,		200							
Mansfield and Holman,		300							
Burrillville,		588							
Branch Village,		100							
Slatersville,		750							
		16,238	2.45	39,783				63,735	
West Wrentham,	31								
Bellingham,	28½	1,000	2.00	2,000	3,900	86	3,354	5,354	
North Wrentham,	25	500	1.75	875	600	75	450	1,325	
Franklin,	25	2,572	1.75	4,501	6,000	75	4,500	9,001	
*Medway,	24	8,886	1.68	14,928	15,262	72	10,988	25,916	
*Medfield,	18	1,453	1.26	1,830	6,969	54	3,763	5,593	
*Dover,	14	4,800	.98	4,704	6,932	42	2,911	7,615	
*East Needham,	11	1,639	.77	1,118	7,738	33	2,553	3,671	
*Newton Upper Falls,	8½	9,136	.58	5,298	14,070	25	3,517	8,815	Half a million and over.
*Newton Centre,	7	1,819	.49	891	26,082	21	5,477	6,368	
*Brighton,	4½		.31		10,000	12	1,200	1,200	Two millions and over.
Brookline,	3½		.24		48,000	10	4,800	4,800	
		18,043		168,365			118,393		

\* Amount for Passengers between Brighton and various places, (as proved.) 10,242

\* Receipts for Freight from Brighton to Woonsocket, &c. - - - 5,929

" for Way business to other stations, - - - 5,000

" for Mails and Expresses, - - - 5,900

Receipts for the Road, as a Local Road to Woonsocket, merely, \$ 168,635

Expenses of running, each day, 6 trains through, and 1 special trains, at 60 cents per mile, - - - \$46,543

Interest on cost of Local Road, (\$1,183,272,) - - - 70,997

Surplus over 6 per cent. - - - 51,095

Or more than TEN PER CENT. on the invested capital of \$1,183,272, for a local road to Woonsocket only.

Or more than 8 per cent. on a capital of \$1,451,221, for the like extent of first rate Road to New York, from way business only, situated on the same extent of road.

Equipments in each case complete, and in running order.

## FURTHER ESTIMATE.

To the amount of Receipts, as given above, - - - \$168,635

may be added, if it is correct to include the same for the Perkins Route, as done in the Tables for the same,

The "Total for Freight and Passengers" of Douglas, - - - \$8,608

" " " " Uxbridge, - - - 5,432

" " " " Northbridge, - - - 9,450

The excess given in said Tables for Perkins Route, as for Freight and Passengers of Blackstone, Woonsocket, and vicinity, - - - 11,317

For County Business to Dedham (from the whole westerly side of Norfolk County, on the Pettee Route,) the same sum as included in said Tables for the Perkins Route, - - - 10,000

Excess and error in the Perkins Est. of Fr't for Bellingham and Franklin, 1,100 45,907

Giving for Receipts for Local Road, by the Pettee Route, to Woonsocket, - - - \$214,542

And deducting expenses as above, - - - \$46,543

Net Income, - - - 167,999

Or more than 13 per cent. on \$1,183,272 cost of Local Road.

Or more than 11 per cent. on \$1,451,221 cost of like extent of through Road to New York, without here adding any thing for accessions to this part from the continuation of the line beyond Woonsocket, (as done in said tables for the Perkins route.)

\* From Medway to Brighton, inclusive, the business requiring Railroad accommodation to Boston, and not met by the Walpole or "Norfolk County Route," exceeds that from all places beyond Medway, the Valley of the Blackstone included, in the proportion, as to tons, of 27,233 to 29,310; and in the proportion, as to passengers, (Brookline excluded) of \$7,033 to \$3,312; and the total income for the same portions of territory, is in the proportion of \$9,229 to \$3,115, even at the same rates per mile for the longer as for the shorter distances. And while the Central Route accommodates ALL the foregoing, both above and below Medway, the "Norfolk County Route" can accommodate only the smaller proportions indicated by the figures above.

Water-power below Medway, directly on the Central Route, on Charles River, 82,080 spindles—not at all met by the Norfolk County Route; but the Central Route accommodates also the same which that does.

## Central and Direct Land Route from BOSTON to NEW YORK.

PETITIONED FOR BY OTIS PETTEE AND OTHERS.

TABLE NO. 2.

Amounts of Freight and Passengers, *per annum*, as at present existing on the Line, to be *transported over the parts between Woonsocket and the East Line of Connecticut*, of the proposed Railroad between Boston and New Haven.

[illegible]

# Central and Direct Land Route from BOSTON to NEW YORK,

PETITIONED FOR BY OTIS PETTEE AND OTHERS.

Summary of receipts computed for WAY BUSINESS as at present existing on the line of the Route, requiring Rail Road accommodation, and to be transported over the proposed direct Rail Road between Boston and New Haven, without herein including anything for through business between Boston and New York, or the termini, or from any places beyond.

---

Amount of Receipts for Way Business between Boston and Woonsocket, as per Table, No. I,	\$168,635
Amount of Receipts for Way Business on account of the Line in Rhode Island, between Woonsocket and Connecticut Line, as per Table, No. II,	166,955
Amount of Receipts for Way Business on the proposed New York and Boston Rail Road, between New Haven and the east line of Connecticut, as shown by the Table for that part,	230,281
Total for Way Business,	<hr/> \$565,871

Expenses of running between Boston and Woonsocket, (Ten Trains,) as per Table, No. I,	\$46,543
Expenses of running, each day, in addition, four Passenger Accommodation Trains, through, between Boston and New Haven, and two Freight Trains between Woonsocket and New Haven, as continuations,	141,226
Total Running Expenses,	<hr/> \$187,769

Cost of Road in Massachusetts,	\$1,451,221
“ “ Rhode Island,	411,090
“ “ Connecticut,	2,538,000
Total Cost,	<hr/> \$4,400,311

Interest on cost, \$4,400,311, is	\$264,019
Surplus, over six per cent.	114,083

Or more than EIGHT AND A HALF PER CENT on the invested capital for WAY BUSINESS ONLY, now existing in the line of the route and requiring Rail Road accommodation, and without allowing anything for increase in consequence of the Road.

To this is to be added the net income from Passengers and Freight between Boston and New York, New Haven, and places between New Haven and New York.

# AMOUNTS OF FREIGHT AND PASSENGERS, PER ANNUM, ON THE PROPOSED NEW YORK AND BOSTON RAILROAD, BETWEEN NEW HAVEN AND THE EAST LINE OF CONNECTICUT.

			(Dist.)	Tons of Freight,	Rate,	Receipts,	Total,	No. of Passengers	Rate,	Receipts,	Total,
Between Rhode Island Line and Connecticut River, -	-	-	60	125	4,20	\$804,00					
" " " " and New Haven, -	-	-	84	200	5,10	1,180,00	\$1,684,00	500	2,50	\$1,250,00	\$1,250,00
" Nor. and Wor. and E. line State, -	-	-	7	1,450	50	725,00		3,100	20	620,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	53	625	3,70	2,312,50					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	77	260	5,40	1,404,00	4,441,50	1,050	2,30	2,415,00	3,035,00
" Pomfret and E. line State, -	-	-	14	850	1,00	850,00		3,000	40	1,200,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	46	340	3,20	1,088,00					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	70	150	4,90	735,00	2,673,00	1,000	2,10	2,100,00	3,300,00
" Hampton and E. line State, -	-	-	19	920	1,35	1,242,00		2,980	55	1,631,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	41	1,170	2,90	3,393,00					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	65	300	4,55	1,365,00	6,000,00	2,810	2,00	5,620,00	7,319,00
" Chaplin and E. line State, -	-	-	24	50	1,70	136,00		650	75	487,50	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	36	40	2,70	1,060,00					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	69	140	4,20	588,00	1,724,00	600	1,80	1,080,00	1,567,50
" Willimantic and E. line State, -	-	-	30	700	2,10	1,470,00		3,640	90	3,276,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	30	3,175	2,10	6,667,50					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	54	1,125	3,80	4,275,00	12,412,50	6,100	1,60	9,760,00	13,036,90
" Columbia and E. line State, -	-	-	34	450	2,40	1,080,00		750	1,00	750,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	26	1,350	1,80	2,430,00					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	50	430	3,50	1,505,00	5,015,00	2,300	1,50	3,450,00	4,260,00
" Hebron and E. line State, -	-	-	40	120	2,80	336,00		660	1,20	792,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	20	2,135	1,40	1,594,00					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	44	230	3,10	713,00	2,638,00	2,350	1,30	3,055,00	3,821,00
" Marlborough and E. line State, -	-	-	44	250	3,10	775,00		750	1,30	910,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	16	1,350	1,10	1,485,00					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	40	400	2,80	1,120,00	4,684,00	2,800	1,20	3,360,00	4,270,00
" Chatham and E. line State, -	-	-	54	250	3,80	950,00		1,80	1,60	288,00	
" " " and Con. River, -	-	-	6	600	40	240,00					
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	50	100	2,10	210,00	1,400,00	1,200	90	1,080,00	1,368,00
" Middletown and E. line State, -	-	-	60	3,475	4,20	14,595,00		5,650	1,00	10,170,00	
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	24	5,050	1,70	8,585,00	23,080,00	23,050	75	17,534,00	27,624,00
" Durham and E. line State, -	-	-	65	40	4,55	1,820,00		150	1,95	292,50	
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	19	150	1,35	202,50	381,50	2,500	60	1,500,00	1,702,50
" Wallingford and E. line State, -	-	-	72	100	5,05	505,00		150	2,15	322,50	
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	12	350	85	297,50	802,50	600	35	210,00	532,50
" North Haven and E. line State, -	-	-	78	100	5,45	545,00		470	2,35	1,104,50	
" " " and New Haven, -	-	-	6	405	40	162,00	707,00	3,500	20	700,00	1,804,50
For freight, \$37,061,00								For Passengers, \$75,220,00			

Aggregate Receipts at 7 cents per ton per mile for Freight, ..... \$17,071  
Aggregate Receipts at 7 cents per mile, each passenger, ..... 5,529

Existing business on the line of the Road, ..... \$132,81  
Add 50 per cent for income, ..... 113,50  
Add passengers from Norwich and Worcester Railroad, ..... 113,50  
At 10 cents more than 10 miles distant, ..... 25,000  
Add business between way stations, exclusive of Freight to Conn. River, ..... 12,000  
Add Mail and Express, ..... 15,000  
\$314,106

X. B. The above exhibit of Freight is exclusive of the agricultural products of Towns, live stock and lumber prepared for market,  
(Signed) AUGUSTUS W. SMITH.  
JOHN JOHNSTON.

State of Connecticut, ) ss. MIDDLETOWN.  
County of Middlesex, )  
Augustus W. Smith and John Johnston, both of said Middletown, being duly sworn, depose and say, that the within written tabular estimate, by them made and subscribed, of receipts for freight and passengers on the proposed New York and Boston Railroad between New Haven and the East Line of Connecticut, has been compiled by them, after examination and inquiry made by the one or the other of them personally, in all the Towns on the proposed route or near the same, and that the said estimate is just and true, according to their best knowledge and belief.

\* This item for increase is not included in the summary on the preceding page.

Middletown, February 16th, 1847. Sworn to and subscribed by the said Augustus W. Smith and John Johnston, this 16th day of February, A. D. 1847, before me the undersigned, Notary Public, duly commissioned and sworn, dwelling in said Middletown. I declare in testimony, that the said documents are well known to me and are respectable and credible witnesses.

AUGUSTUS W. SMITH,  
JOHN JOHNSTON.  
(In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my hand and the Seal of Office,  
JONATHAN RAINESE, Notary Public.

Population within 5 miles of the Railroad line from New Haven to the East line of Connecticut, ..... 91,000  
Number of Cotton and Woolen Mills in Towns lying within 5 miles of the line between New Haven and East line of Connecticut, ..... 59  
Number of Grist and Saw-mills in Towns lying within 5 miles of the line between New Haven and East line of Connecticut, ..... 187  
Total amount of Capital invested in Manufactures, &c., in do. do. .... \$1,772,787  
Total amount of annual returns from said capital, ..... \$510,635

Unemployed Water Power on the line at Willimantic and within 7 miles thereof, ..... 130,000 spindles.  
Employed Water Power do. do. do. .... 61,000 spindles.  
Existing Water Power within 7 miles of the line in vicinity of Willimantic, estimated at, ..... 191,000 spindles.  
Of which more than three quarters are within three fourths of a mile from the line of the proposed Railroad.  
There is also Water Power on the Salmon River in East Hadham and Colchester, of which there is unemployed, equal to ..... 35,000 spindles.